



Report from the Temporary Subgroup on "Hot Spots" Exclusion (2010 – 2011)

The temporary Subgroup on Hotspots Exclusion (SHE) under the Barents Euro-Arctic Council Working Group on Environment (BEAC WGE) was established in 2010 in order to facilitate the exclusion of the 42 "Hot Spots" from the Barents Euro Arctic Environmental "Hot Spots" List in accordance with the groups mandate and the Criteria and Procedures described in the Final Report to the Ministers of Environment, adopted in Tromsø on 17th of February, 2010.

This report reflects the efforts and achievements made by SHE during the Swedish chairmanship of the Working Group on Environment during 2010-2011 and refers to the objectives and activities set in the SHE Work Programme for 2010-2011.

MANDAT

SHE was given the mandate from the Barents Environment Ministers in Tromsø 2010, in the period towards the next ministerial meeting, to Facilitate the process of exclusion of the Barents Environmental "Hot Spots" in accordance with the Criteria & Procedures. The Ministers acknowledged the need to prioritize and initially focus on certain "Hot Spots" in order to ensure tangible results, and therefore also encouraged further efforts to:

- Explore possibilities to develop and implement projects together with the Subgroup on Cleaner Production and Environmentally Sound Consumption (CPESC Subgroup) as well as with the NEFCO Barents Hot Spot Facility (BHSF),
- Strengthen and build on the work of existing regional working groups on "hot spots" in the republics of Komi, Karelia and in Murmansk Oblast and Nenets Autonomous District,
- Explore possibilities for synergies with the work carried out in the Arctic Council, including its Project Support Instrument and NPA Arctic, and other sources of financing,
- Rise awareness about the Barents Environmental "hot spots",
- Safeguard the development of an information system about the Barents Environmental "hot spots" list as part of the Barents Euro Arctic Councils web site by the end of 2010.
- Review the criteria and procedure for hot spot exclusion before the 2011 Ministerial meeting.

See also the 2010 Ministerial Declaration, points 9 – 15.

OBJECTIVES AND PRIORITIES UNDER THE SWEDISH CHAIRMANSHIP

3.1. SHE OBJECTIVES IN GENERAL

Despite of the fact that the mandate for SHE so far is limited to two years, long and medium term objectives reaching beyond this period had to be formulated in order to point out the direction for the work of the subgroup. Recognising these *Long Term Objective* and *Medium Term Objective* and based on its Mandate, SHE identified an *Overall Objective* and six *Short Term Objectives*, O1 – O6, for its work, based on which seven groups of Activities were formulated (see the SHE Work Programme 2010-2011).

SHE Overall Objective is that the Exclusion procedure with all its staff and stakeholders is effectively operative in all five federation subjects and that relevant actions or projects have been or are likely to be launched for all the 42 "Hot Spots" by 2013.

In accordance with the general principles for follow-up of project/program implementation, the achievement of the Long term objective is supposed to be measurable within some years and the Medium term objectives within one year after end of implementation, i.e. in this case soon after the end of 2013.

3.2. OBJECTIVES FOR THE SHE WORK DURING THE SWEDISH CHAIRMANSHIP

As terms of reference for the work during the Swedish chairmanship, more specified objectives were formulated for the work in 2010-2011:

SHE Overall Objective for 2010-2011 is to have a good overview of all the "Hot Spots", have the procedure operative in all five Federation Subjects (incl. possible revisions) and to have the first "Hot Spots" ready for exclusion.

SHE Operational Objectives for 2010-2011 is that:

- a) the Initiation of Procedure (Step 1 of the agreed Procedure) is in full progress for all 42 "Hot Spots" by 2010;
- b) the Screening and Analysis (Step 2 of the agreed Procedure) has been completed for at least two "Hot Spots" in each of the five Federation Subjects in the Russian part of Barents by 2011;
- c) regional "Hot Spots" exclusion groups have been established in all five Federation Subjects in the Russian part of Barents by 2010,
- d) Applications for Exclusion (Step 7 of the agreed Procedure) has been submitted for at least one or two of the 42 "Hot Spots" by 2010.

It is against these SHE Operational Objectives for 2010-2011 (a, b, c, d) that the work and achievement made by SHE will be assessed in this report.

IMPLEMENTATION REPORT

4.1. WORK DONE

In order to achieve the set Short Term Objectives, O1 – O6, seven groups of Activities are formulated in the SHE Work Programme. The work done in

SHE during the Swedish chairmanship thus is reported with reference to these planned activities:

Meeting activities (M), relating to all Objectives O1-O6

In total 20 meetings of subgroup were conducted during the period, out of which 8 took place physically and 12 were made on the telephone. During these meetings, among other, issues related to the other activities were handled. See Appendix 6a-6t: Minutes from SHE1 – SHE20.

In addition to the meetings within the subgroup, three joint meetings were arranged between SHE and the regional Hotspot Exclusion Groups (HEGs). On November 9th, 2010, SHE met with the Karelian HEG in Petrozavodsk, on June 9th, 2011, with the Komi HEG in Syktyvkar and on July 8th, 2011, SHE met with the Murmansk HEG in Murmansk. Furthermore, three joint SHE-HEG meetings were arranged in Moscow between SHE and representatives of all of the five regional HEGs. These meetings took place on February 25th, September 22nd and October 25th 2011. See Appendix 7a-7f.

Procedure linked activities (P1-P7)

Focus during the period was made on Initiation of the procedure (P1) incl. the establishment of the regional Hot Spot Exclusion Groups, HEGs. Related to this, the drafting and refinement of "Templates" for the formal dialogue between the Ministry of Nature Resources of Environment of the Russian Federation (Minpriroda RF) and the regional HEGs showed necessary in order to promote progress. Furthermore, templates for the "Screening & Analysis report" (P2) and "Application for Exclusion" (P7) also were drafted and distributed to the regional HEGs in autumn 2011.

Not foreseen during the drafting of the Work Programme 2010-2011, was the establishment of a network of technical experts from all four countries, required to review and give comments to the applications for exclusion. Technical experts have been (and will be in the future) invited to comment the exclusion proposals case by case: the expertise needed will depend on the hot spot in question.

Visit activities (V)

Apart of the visits to the regional HEGs arranged in combination with the ordinary BEAC WGE meetings in Petrozavodsk 8-9 of November 2010 and in Syktyvkar 9-10 of June 2011, only Murmansk HEG was visited by SHE as a separate activity. On the other hand Murmansk was visited twice - on July 7-8 and on July 22, 2011. The first visit to Murmansk was made in combination with the presentation of the CPESC 4.1 "Pajala project" while the second visit was made in order to refine documents related to the Exclusion Procedure, in particular the Exclusion Procedure itself and the Template for the Mandate of the HEGs.

During the visits to the regional HEGs, the following Hotspots were visited:
Ko3 – The Water Treatment Plant of Syktyvkar, 8th of June 2011

Ko2 – "Vorkutinskiy Cement Plant" (Only the Swedish co-chair on 29-30th of June 2011).

M2 – The "Severonickel" nickel smelter facility in Monchegorsk 8th of July 2011

Awareness activities (A1-A2)

In order to work effectively and strategically with the awareness making both of the problems related to the environmental hot spots and of the

efforts made to solve them, the subgroup has started drafting a Communication Plan (A1). Target group is both the general public and the enterprises and branches pointed out as or affected by the Barents Environmental Hot Spots.

For keeping the information system up-date (A2), a set of basic documents have been selected for the web-site and instructions were formulated for the regional HEGs to prepare basic information on their respective hot spots. Such "basic information charts" were prepared for the primary set of hot spots selected for fast track exclusion in 2011.

Synergy activities– (S1-S5)

During the BEAC WGE meeting in Petrozavodsk 9 of November 2010, a joint workshop was organised between the SHE and CPESC subgroups (S1). During SHE meetings, NEFCO has explained the procedures of the BHSF and CPF within SHE (S3) and NEFCO has made presentations to the regional HEGs both in Petrozavodsk, Syktyvkar, Murmansk and Moscow to explain how BHSF could be used by the regional groups and other stakeholders (S4). Furthermore, NEFCO will post further information and links etc related to its funds and financial mechanisms and how they can contribute to project development, project implementation and general support to the exclusion process, at the HotSpot information website (S5).

Information activities– SHE (I1-I2)

On December 14, 2010, SHE finalised the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the information system (I1) and in follow of that assigned NEFCO to hire a consultant based on the ToR (I2).

Review of Criteria & Procedure - SHE (R1-R3)

In follow of the work with the procedure related activities (P1, P2 and P7) and the intensified dialogue with the regional HEGs, a refinement of the Exclusion Procedure was made. The review work was made operatively but not following the drafted activities in the Work Plan (R1-R3).

4.2. DEVIATIONS FROM PLAN

(P) No projects for supporting the Step 2, Step 4 or step 6 were developed during the period. The reason for this is that only Fast Track projects have been dealt with during the period and that the Screening & Analysis for these hotspots so far has not required any support projects.

(V) No visits were foretaken to Arkhangelsk or to Nenets. The plan to carry out two visits to each of the five the regional HEGs failed.

(A) Since the work with the Screening and Analysis (P2) started late, there has not been much information to keep the information system up-dated with. However, the regional HEGs are preparing "Basic Information Charts" on the primary set of hot spots for the web-site.

(S) No real joint projects were yet amended into the work program of the SHE and CPESC subgroups (S2). No draft a short report which explores possibilities for synergies with the Arctic Council, NPA Arctic and other groups relevant to cooperate with (S6). These activities are possible and relevant to carry out during 2012.

(R) The review work did not follow the activities as described in the Work Plan: To draft a process, including criteria for the Review (R1), to carry out the review according to this specified process (R2) and to present it to the 2011 ministerial meeting of BEAC WGE (R3).

ASSESSMENT OF ACHIEVEMENTS

5.1. ACHIEVEMENTS

Documents facilitating implementation of the Exclusion Procedure

During the Swedish chairmanship period lasting from February 2010 till November 2011, the BEAC WGE Subgroup for Hotspots Exclusion, SHE, together with the Ministry of Nature Resources and Ecology of the Russian Federation, Minpriroda RF, have

- appointed regional Hotspot Exclusion Groups, HEGs, in all of the five Federation Subjects included in the Barents co-operation, (D1a)
- elaborated and agreed Mandates for the HEGs (D1b) which in turn have appointed their members in accordance with these Mandates and started their work. primary review of the respective sets of primarily selected hotspots for exclusion in accordance with the Exclusion Procedure adopted in Tromsø in February 2010 (D1c).
- Based on the priorities expressed by the regional HEGs, Minpriroda RF with support from SHE has started drafting a first "General Exclusion Plan" , guiding the further work of SHE and the HEGs.

Having executed this, SHE and Minpriroda RF have basically carried out Step 1 for all of the 42 hotspots and now has instructed the regional HEGs (in the Republic of Karelia, the Komi Republic, the Arkhangelsk Oblast, the Murmansk Oblast and in the Nenets Autonomous Okrug) to start the work on Step 2 (Screening & Analysis) for the hotspots primarily selected for exclusion in November 2011 in accordance with a Report Template (D2a) for the Screening & Analysis Report.

In follow of this instruction, HEGs in four of the five Russian Federation Subjects included in the Barents region (the Republic of Karelia, the Komi Republic, the Arkhangelsk Oblast and the Murmansk Oblast) have submitted Screening & Analysis (D2b) reports and Applications for Exclusions (D7a) on selected hotspots. All deliverables are listed in Appendix 1

Hotspots suggested by the regional HEGs for Exclusion in 2011

During the three joint meetings between SHE and the regional HEGs, the HEGs presented reviews of their respective hotspots and proposed candidates for exclusion from the Hotspot list. From an initial list of eight hotspots in all five regions proposed in the first meeting in February 2011, the final proposals gathered till the third meeting in October 2011, comprised the following four hotspots:

Republic of Karelia:	K10 – Stocks of Obsolete Pesticides
Komi Republic:	Ko7 – Wastes from timber, pulp and paper industry
Arkhangelsk Oblast:	A10 – Stocks of Obsolete Pesticides
Murmansk Oblast:	M8 – Mercury containing wastes
Nenets Autonomous Okrug	No hotspots proposed at third joint meeting.

Hotspots that SHE proposes BEAC WGE to recommend for Exclusion in 2011

Based on the Applications for Exclusion and attached Screening & Analysis reports submitted by the regional HEGs to SHE and accounting the comments collected from the Technical Expert Committee, the Subgroup for Hotspots Exclusion proposes BEAC WGE to recommend the Ministers to exclude the following hotspots from the Barents Environmental Hot Spot List:

- K10 – Stocks of Obsolete Pesticides
- A10 – Stocks of Obsolete Pesticides
- M8 – Mercury containing wastes

Given that all expert assessments are positive and the WGE decides to exclude the three hot spots proposed the revised Barents Environmental Hot Spots List from 2011 thus will contain 39 hotspots. Proposals from the HEGs to change the names of some of the hotspots to more appropriate names was not approved. Instead it is proposed to up-date the hotspot list further during next Ministerial Meeting by a more thorough report, based on the work done by SHE and the HEGs in terms of completion of the Step 2 "Screening and Analysis" for all hotspots.

Revision of the Criteria & Procedure

During the work with the implementation, in particular with the regional HEGs, the Exclusion Procedure has been refined. The refinement in particularly concerned the definition of the organisational entities (constellation of authorities) that are responsible for different steps and "sub-steps" of the Exclusion Procedure as well as the formulation of these "sub-steps". For management purposes as well as for an enhanced communication between SHE and the HEGs, a new column with "deliverables" has been added to the Exclusion Procedure where the documentary output required as "evidence" for the completion of each step and sub-step is reflected. In order to promote the production of such outputs, Templates were elaborated which later were refined to formal documents that were/are to be issued by the different organisational entities foreseen to implement the Exclusion Procedure.

The last up-dated version of the Exclusion Procedure is attached to this SHE Report in Appendix 2. Some additional refinement of the Exclusion Procedure though is likely in follow of the further implementation work, in particular with the Steps 3 – Steps 6 that has not been implemented during the period of the Swedish Chairmanship.

5.2. ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO SET OBJECTIVES FOR THE SHE WORK IN GENERAL

SHE Short Term Objectives	Assessment of Achievement
O1 – A well functioning and operative procedure of exclusion	The procedure has started and works so far. Step 1 is done for all 42 hotspots and Step 2, Step 7 and Step 8 are have been put into operation for part of the hot spots. Objective 1 is well under way to be achieved (40%)
O2 - Regional "Hot Spots" groups operating in all five Federation Subjects	Regional HEGs are appointed, are working according to Mandates and are now implementing the Procedure for primarily selected hotspots. Based on their priorities, a

	"General Exclusion Plan" is under preparation for continuous planning and follow-up of implementation. Objective 2 is well under way to be achieved (40%)
O3 - Raised awareness about the Barents Environmental "Hot Spots".	Awareness on the nature and political context of the hot spots as well as of the Exclusion Procedure has been raised at regional authorities and part of the enterprises involved. No or little awareness raising has been done to broader segments of the local populations or to the Barents community in general. Objective 3 is getting started to be achieved (20%)
O4 - Productive co-operation with CPESC, BHSF, ACAP, AMAP, PSI, NPA Arctic, etc.	Discussions with CPESC and BHSF initiated but no concrete actions or results so far. In follow of further implementation of the Exclusion Procedure and, in particular, in follow of further work with more difficult hotspots, the possibilities for Productive Co-operation is supposed to be clarified. Objective 4 is only poorly starting to be achieved (10%)
O5 - A well functioning information system about the hotspots.	The structure of the Information system is in place and initial information has been posted (basic documents for the SHE and HEG work as well as basic information on the primarily selected hotspots for exclusion). Objective 5 is under way to be achieved (30%)
O6 - Reviewed and revised "Criteria and Procedure"	During implementation of the Procedure, its feasibility could be verified and input for revision was collected. Objective 6 is well under way to be achieved (40%)

5.2. ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO SET OBJECTIVES FOR THE SE CHAIRM.

SHE Operational Objectives for the Swedish Chairmanship 2010-2011	Assessment of Achievement
a) the Initiation of Procedure (Step 1 of the agreed Procedure) is in full progress for all 42 "Hot Spots" by 2010;	Step 1 was completed for all 42 hotspots in autumn 2011. In follow of continued implementation, refinement of some documents is required, but in general Objective a) is done (however with delay)!
b) the Screening and Analysis (Step 2 of the agreed Procedure) has been completed for at least two "Hot Spots" in each of the five Federation Subjects in the Russian part of Barents by 2011;	Step 2 is completed only for one hot spot each in Arkhangelsk, Karelia, Komi and Murmansk but for none in Nenets. Objective b) achieved only partially, however 4 of 5 regions have started the Screening & Analysis (Step 2)
c) regional "Hot Spots" exclusion groups have been established in all five Federation Subjects in the Russian part of Barents by 2010,	Chairs of the regional HEGs were appointed in 2010, but the actual appointment of members according to mandate was made only in autumn 2011. Objective c) is done (however with delay).
d) Applications for Exclusion (Step 7 of the agreed Procedure) has been submitted for at least one or two of the 42 "Hot Spots" by 2010.	No Applications for Exclusion were received in 2010 Objective d) is done (however with delay).

CHAIR

5.3. FAILED OR INSUFFICIENT ACHIEVEMENTS

Although Objective 1 and 2 are well under way to be achieved, continued efforts are needed to safeguard satisfactory performance of the procedure and the regional HEGs respectively as well as full achievement of the objectives at the end.

The poor achievement of Objectives 3 and 4 is connected by the relatively late start of the operative work with the regional HEGs. This was connected to the formal definitions and appointments of the addressed authorities in the regions which required time. Now having established a more operative contact with the regional HEGs, both awareness making and supportive actions have better prerequisites to find relevant forms.

The function and "informativity" of the hotspots information system is there, but is rather poor at the moment. This also is connected with the relatively late start of the operative work with information gathering and assessment as foreseen by the Screening & Analysis (step 2). In follow of continued implementation of the Procedure, the information input to the Hotspots information system also is likely to proceed.

The review of the Procedure is sufficient at this level, but has to be continued to work with also during the following implementation.

RECOMMENDATIONS TO BEAC WGE

- The work with the hotspots exclusion will require continued support efforts also beyond 2013. The **mandate** for the Subgroup for Hotspots Exclusion, SHE, therefore should **be extended**.
- Much efforts have been put to enhance the Hotspot Exclusion Procedure and adapt it to real administrative prerequisites and SHE therefore asks **WGE to approve the revised Hotspot Exclusion Procedure** in Appendix 2.
- Recognising the conclusions of the applicants and technical experts, **SHE proposes WGE to exclude the hotspots "Stocks of obsolete pesticides (Arkhangelsk, A10), Stocks of obsolete pesticides (Karelia, K10) and Mercury containing waste (Murmansk, M8) from the List and to approve the Revised Barents Environmental Hotspots List** attached in Appendix 9.
- There is a group of hotspots deemed fairly well off for exclusion within one year. In follow-up of the Final Report to the Ministers, delivered in Tromsø on February 17, 2011, the BEAC WGE takes decision on exclusion and it is thus **recommended that further exclusions are planned for during 2012**.
- The format and logics of the SHE Work Plan is deemed appropriate. It is recommended to keep basically the same Objectives and up-date the activities for 2012-2013. In order to keep the pace, to get a better overview, settle the work with the HEGs as well as to increase awareness making, it is **recommended that Step 2 "Screening & Analysis" is completed for all 42 hotspots till next ministerial meeting in 2013**.
- The endorsement chain from central level towards the regional Hotspots Exclusion Groups (the HEGs) have a significant role in the implementation of the Hotspot Exclusion Procedure. It is **recommended that as well staff resources as administrative attention from the Ministry of Nature Resources of the Russian Federation is provided for**.

- The work with supporting actions has only started and need to be continued and broadened. It is **recommended that this work continues and that repeated and deepened efforts for explanation and guiding to NEFCO's support instruments and other supportive activities are planned for during 2012-2013.** It is though very important that these activities are well coordinated with SHE and the HEGs and the position of the HEG's and their respective hot spots in relation to the Procedure.
- It is also **recommended that SHE seeks to explore and utilises possible synergies with other BEAC Working groups and sub-groups**, particularly the WGE CPESC sub-group.
- Also the **Hotspot Information System has only started to function and does stil lack a lot of information. As the Step 2 "Screening and Analysis"** is fulfilled for further hotspots, the Information System also will be further enriched with information. However, there is also a need for more Awareness raising also of other kind and it is **recommended that the Awareness raising activities are enhanced during 2012-2013.**

The work with the Hot Spots Exclusion generally is based on the NEFCO/AMAP Report from 2003. A revised and up-dated Hot Spot Report should be prepared till the next Ministerial meeting and describe the environmental status of the 42 hot spots, as well as the efforts made and results achieved in respect to the Exclusion Procedure.

