



Minutes

45th Meeting of the Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion (SHE#45)

Syktyvkar, 2nd of November 2015

1. Opening of the Meeting

The meeting was opened and attended by the following Members of the SHE-group:

- Russia: Ms Maria Dronova (Chair),
- Sweden: Mr Åke Mikaelsson (Co-Chair), Ms Nadya Maslova
- Finland: Ms Emma Nurmi, Ms Henna Haapala
- Norway: Ms Hanne Aronsen, Ms. Helen Johanne Andersen
- NEFCO: Mr Henrik Forsström, Mr Ruslan Butovski
- International Barents Secretariat (IBS): Ms Maria Dianova

In addition, the meeting was attended also by the following special invitees:

- Mr Vasilij Fyodorov, Rosprirodnadzor Department for Northwest Federal District
- Mr Alexander Popov, Director of Rosprirodnadzor in the Komi Republic
- Mr Alexey Startsev¹, Deputy Chairman of the Government of the Komi Republic
- Mr Roman Polshvedkin, Minister for Nature Resources and Environment of the Komi Republic
- Mr Mikhail Kolegov, Deputy Minister for Nature Resources and Environment of the Komi Republic
- Mr Vasily Smalij², Committee on natural resources and environment of the Komi Republic
- Mr Evgeniy Grigoriev, Dpt for international and interregional relations of the Komi Republic
- Mr Ivan Popov, Ministry of Nature Resources, Environment and Forestry Industry Arkhangelsk Oblast
- Mr Jonas Ossian Liimatta, North Ostrobothnian Centre for Economic Development, Traffic and Environment,
- Mr Yan Tsygankov, Centre for Cleaner Production and Sustainable Development

2. Adoption of the Agenda

The meeting agenda was adopted with minor changes.

3. Review and adoption of the Minutes from previous meetings

- a) It was concluded that the Minutes from SHE 42 on 2-3 September 2015, still require adjustments and it was agreed that commented versions are submitted till the 9th of November 2015.
- b) The Minutes from SHE 43 on 12th of October 2015 was adopted.
- c) It was agreed that additional comments to the Minutes from SHE 44 on 28th of October 2015, should be submitted till the 9th of November 2015.

¹ Please assist in confirmation that this is the correct person that was presented in the SHE#45 meeting

² Please assist in confirmation that this is the correct person that was presented in the SHE#45 meeting

4. Follow-up of the tasks distributed at the previous meeting

It was concluded that the Draft Final Statements for the hot spots A3-2, K4, Ko3-1 had been submitted to all SHE members and that primary comments made a good base for refinement discussions during the meeting.

Regarding A4 it was concluded that the enterprise's Response to the Technical Expert Committee's 2nd Round of Comments, still generate unclarity for TEC and that so far no final conclusion could be formulated.

It was concluded that the expected Response from Karelia on the TEC Comments on K7 yet not were received and also that no representative from Karelia will attend the WGE Meeting. Based on this, it was agreed to leave K7 for the moment and discuss the expected response in Sortavala if ready. The paper on NEFCO's activities in the Karelian water management sector will be submitted by Mr Forsström till the 11th of November 2015.

It was concluded that the hot spot owner's response on the secondary TEC comments on Ko1 had been received. The TEC have further questions on the hotspot owner's Response.

Regarding Ko2-1, it was commented that an up-dated Screening & Analysis Report had been submitted to MNRE. It was stressed that the feasibility study and action planning conducted within the frames of NEFCO's assignment under the ACAP Expert Group on Dioxins is expected to be deliver guiding results on Friday 7th of November, and that these conclusions better be regarded, in particular with respect to the action plan and funding issues.

5. Decisions on the hotspots proposed for Fast Track Exclusion

a) A3-2: Severodvinsk Combined Heat and Power Plant No 2

The Draft Final Statement on A3-2, incl. comments collected from the SHE-group since the previous meeting, was presented. It was noted that Swedish experts did not recommend the hot spot for exclusion, due to high NOx emissions but that SHE, due to as well the conclusion of Rosprirodnadzor as the conclusions of the Finnish and Norwegian technical experts, has deemed it justified to exclude the hot spot A3-2 on the current conditions.

SHE concluded that the hot spot A3-2 is ready to be proposed to WGE for Exclusion from the Hot Spot List by Fast Track Exclusion.

It was decided that Ms Aronsen refines the Draft Final Statement on A3-2 based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE on 3rd of November 2015.

b) A4: Novodvinsk Pulp and Paper Mill

The situation at hotspot A4 was briefly presented and it was noted that there have been two rounds of comments from the Technical Expert Committee and that an updated version of the Screening & Analysis report was received. Nordic experts still have questions, e.g. regarding NOx emissions and also regarding the temporary limits.

It was noted that SHE previously has taken a principal decision on not excluding by fast track a hot spot that is operating on temporary limit values.

SHE concluded that a further discussion with Nordic experts and within SHE has to follow.

It was agreed that Ms Maslova will coordinates the determination of dates for a telephone meeting regarding technical details on A4.

c) K4: Drinking Water in Petrozavodsk

The Draft Final Statement on K4, incl. comments collected from the SHE-group since the previous meeting, was presented. It was noted that Local and International cooperation gave good output.

SHE concluded that the hot spot A3-2 is ready to be proposed to WGE for Exclusion from the Hot Spot List by Fast Track Exclusion.

It was decided that Ms Emma Nurmi and Mr Åke Mikaelsson refine the Draft Final Statement on K4 based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE on 3rd of November 2015.

d) Ko1: Greenhouse gases from Vorkuta coal field

The situation regarding Ko1 was briefly presented and noted that the Technical Expert Committee still have questions to the primary response, which not yet were submitted.

Some of the concerns of the Technical Expert Committee were discussed, e.g. the target level for utilisation of gases from the coal mine (only 40% according to the S&A report) and what the permit says. Mr Alexander Popov from Komi Rosprirodnadzor commented that the current utilisation level is rather 60% and that the gases which are used for heating and electricity at the mine. The site is problematic since much of the methane is superficial and difficult to capture and also of a quality that is difficult to combust. When operations reach deeper horizons, this will change and both capturing and combustion will be easier, which also was to be explained better at the Extended Meeting to follow after SHE#45.

It was noted that a Draft Final Statement had been drafted by Ms Dronova but not yet submitted to SHE.

SHE concluded that a further discussion with Nordic experts and within SHE has to follow.

It was decided that Ms Aronsen arranges collection of secondary comments on Ko1 from the Nordic experts to be discussed at the next SHE meeting.

e) Ko2-1: Vorkutinskiy Cement Plant

The situation at the Vorkutinskiy Cement Plant was briefly presented. It was noted that the Rosprirodnadzor conducted inspections at the plant the week earlier and that the authority now, as well as in earlier statement, is arguing for exclusion due to significant reduction of dust emissions.

It was noted that the final results of the emission analyses and the corresponding action plans to be presented in follow of NEFCO's two assignment under the auspices of the ACAP Expert Group on Dioxins may give important guidance for the further work on Vorkutinskiy Cement Plant.

It was noted that the up-dated Screening & Analysis Report on Ko2-1 had been prepared prior to the approval of NEFCO's two assignment reports on the Vorkutinskiy Cement Plant, conducted under the auspices of the ACAP Expert Group on Dioxins and Furans.

SHE concluded that a further discussion with Nordic experts and within SHE has to follow.

It was decided that Maria Dronova submits the up-dated Screening & Analysis Report on Ko2-1 to SHE till the 9th of November 2015.

f) Ko3-1: Mondi Syktyvkar

The Draft Final Statement on Ko3-1, incl. comments collected from the SHE-group since the previous meeting, was presented. It was noted that SHE recommends the company to keep working on reducing their Climate Impact.

SHE concluded that the hot spot Ko3-1 is ready to be proposed to WGE for Exclusion from the Hot Spot List by Fast Track Exclusion.

It was decided that Ms Aronsen and Ms Dronova refine the Draft Final Statement on Ko3-1, based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE on 3rd of November 2015.

6. Decision on the Specific Criteria for the hotspots selected as pilots for Full Track Exclusion

a) Specific Criteria for A3-1: Severodvinsk Combined Heat and Power Plant No 1

The draft of the Specific Exclusion Criteria elaborated by NEFCO consultant Mr Ruslan Butovskiy (in consultation with Mr Ivan Popov at the Arkhangelsk Ministry of Environment), was presented in the template elaborated by SHE. The following comments were collected:

- Sweden: Criteria “D” should state not only that monitoring should take place, but also address quantitative limits.
- NEFCO stressed that the ash issue (commented in earlier discussions) shall be better taken care of by the Specific Criteria. Also the change of the Logo from the current “Banner” should be changed to the Smaller, quadratic SHE-logo.
- Norway stressed the importance of close coordination with the enterprise and also will submit detailed comments on terminology etc.
- Finland finds the Specific Criteria generally clear and well defined, with the exception for Criteria “C” which may require numerical values.
- Russia stressed that at the current stage, the Specific Criteria should be seen as developed by NEFCO and submitted to SHE for consideration, And serve as a recommendation to the Arkhangelsk HEG.

It was decided that Mr Butovskiy (in consultation with Mr Ivan Popov, coordinates the refinement of the draft Specific Criteria for A3-2 in accordance with the remarks collected at SHE45, and also includes possible further comments received by the Nordic Experts.

b) Specific Criteria for Ko6: Waste Generation in municipalities and cities of the Komi Republic

No specific criteria were presented at the SHE45 meeting.

It was concluded that the Specific Criteria for Ko6 will have to be extracted from the presentation made by Komi republic at the Extended SHE-Meeting, and put into the special template.

c) Specific Criteria for Ko7: Waste from timber, pulp and paper industries in the Komi Republic

No specific criteria were presented at the SHE45 meeting.

It was concluded that the Specific Criteria for Ko7 will have to be extracted from the presentation made by Komi republic at the Extended SHE-Meeting, and put into the special template.

7. Refinement of the Hotspot-section of the Draft Ministerial Declaration

The Hotspot-section of the Draft Ministerial Declaration was discussed, based on the draft that was distributed the week before the Syktyvkar meetings.

It was agreed that Ms Helen Andersen and Ms Henna Haapala, based on the discussions at SHE 45 refine the draft for presentation at WGE.

8. Drafting of the Hotspot-section of the Draft Report to the Ministers

It was noted that the Chair has been preparing a draft of the entire report, but unfortunately could not finalise it prior to the Syktyvkar meetings.

It was agreed that Ms Dronova submits a draft of the “Report to the Ministers” till the 13th of November 2015.

9. Any Other Business

No other issues were raised.

10. Summary of Next Steps and Task Distribution

<u>Task</u>	<u>Responsible</u>	<u>Deadline</u>
Comment on/Approve the Minutes from SHE 42 from 2-3 September 2015	All SHE members	9 th Nov.2015
Comment on/Approve the Minutes from SHE 44 from 28 th of October 2015	All SHE members	9 th Nov.2015
Submit the paper on NEFCO's activities in the Karelian water management sector to SHE, as an input to the assessment on K7	Henrik	11 th Nov.2015
Refine the Draft Final Statement on A3-2 based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE	Hanne	3 rd Nov.2015
Coordinate the determination of dates for a telephone meeting regarding technical details on A4.	Nadya	9 th Nov.2015
Refine the Draft Final Statement on K4 based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE	Emma and Åke	3 rd Nov.2015
Arrange collection of secondary comments on Ko1 from the Nordic experts to be discussed at the next SHE meeting	Hanne	13 th Nov.2015
Submit up-dated Screening & Analysis Report on Ko2-1 to SHE	Maria	9 th Nov.2015
Refine the Draft Final Statement on Ko3-1, based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE	Hanne and Maria	3 rd Nov.2015
Submit detailed comments on terminology etc. regarding the Specific Criteria for A3-2.	Hanne	9 th Nov.2015
Refine the Specific Criteria for A3-2 in accordance with the remarks collected at SHE45 and in coordination with as well Nordic Experts as with Arkhangelsk	Ruslan in close cooperation with Arkhangelsk Oblast	13 th Nov.2015
Extract the Specific Criteria for Ko6 from Komi republic's presentation at the Extended SHE-Meeting and put it into the format of the Template D3.	Tatiana in close cooperation with Komi Republic	13 th Nov.2015
Extract the Specific Criteria for Ko7 from Komi republic's presentation at the Extended SHE-Meeting and put it into the format of the Template D3.	Tatiana in close cooperation with Komi Republic	13 th Nov.2015
Refine the hotspot section of the Draft Ministerial Declaration for presentation at WGE, based on the discussions at SHE 45	Helen + Henna	3 rd Nov.2015
Submit a draft of the "Report to the Ministers" to SHE	Maria	13 th Nov.2015

11. Date for the Next Meeting

It was concluded that a summing up-meeting on the hot spots recommended to WGE for exclusion need to be held prior to the Ministerial Meeting in Sortavala. Based on this *it was agreed* that a telephone meeting be held on the 13th of November 2015, at 13.00 CET /15.00 MT

In addition it was agreed that many detailed issues on conclusions of the Technical Expert Committees as well as on the Final Statements has to take place via e-mail.

12. Closure of the Meeting

The Co-chairs expressed their gratitude to all participants and declared the meeting closed.