



# Minutes

## 46<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion (SHE#46)

Syktyvkar, 13<sup>th</sup> of November 2015

### 1. Opening of the Meeting

The meeting was opened and attended by the following Members of the SHE-group:

- Russia: Ms Maria Dronova (Chair), Mr Ruslan Butovskiy
- Sweden: Mr Åke Mikaelsson (Co-Chair), Ms Nadya Maslova
- Finland: Ms Emma Nurmi
- Norway: Ms Hanne Aronsen, Ms. Helen Johanne Andersen
- NEFCO: Mr Henrik Forsström

### 2. Adoption of the Agenda

The meeting agenda was adopted.

### 3. Review and adoption of the Minutes from previous meetings

Due to lack of time, the non-adopted Minutes could not be reviewed, but a summary on the review situation for SHE42 - SHE45 was made:

	<u>Finland</u>	<u>Norway</u>	<u>Russia</u>	<u>Sweden</u>
SHE 42:	It was agreed that the Minutes needs to be re-edited to a more stringent form (it was noted, concluded, decided etc.) and that Mr Butovskiy submits an updated version to SHE till the 30 <sup>th</sup> of November 2015.			
SHE 43	Adopted			
SHE 44	OK = Satisfied with current reading	Not yet reviewed	OK = Satisfied with current reading	OK = Satisfied with current reading
SHE 45	OK = Satisfied with current reading	Not yet reviewed	Not yet reviewed	OK = Satisfied with current reading

### 4. Follow-up of the tasks distributed at the previous meeting

It was concluded that the tasks had been completed to the extent presented below:

<u>Task</u>	<u>Comment</u>
i. Comment on/Approve the Minutes from SHE 42 from 2-3 September 2015	Requires increased stringency
ii. Comment on/Approve the Minutes from SHE 44 from 28 <sup>th</sup> of October 2015	Still to be reviewed by NO & RU
iii. Submit the paper on NEFCO's activities in the Karelian energy management sector to SHE, as an input to the assessment on K7	Not done. Postponed till 18 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| iv. Refine the Draft Final Statement on A3-2 based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE  | Done!  |
| v. Coordinate the determination of dates for a telephone meeting regarding technical details on A4.   | Done!<br>Meeting held 9 <sup>th</sup> Nov and answers were received  |
| vi. Refine the Draft Final Statement on K4 based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE  | Done!  |
| vii. Arrange collection of secondary comments on Ko1 from the Nordic experts to be discussed at the next SHE meeting  | Not done.<br>Postponed till after MiM  |
| viii. Submit up-dated Screening & Analysis Report on Ko2-1 to SHE   | Done!  |
| ix. Refine the Draft Final Statement on Ko3-1, based on the discussion at SHE so that it can be presented to WGE  | Done!  |
| x. Submit detailed comments on terminology etc. regarding the Specific Criteria for A3-2.   | Done!  |
| xi. Refine the Specific Criteria for A3-2 in accordance with the remarks collected at SHE45 and in coordination with as well Nordic Experts as with Arkhangelsk | Partially done!<br>Updated and submitted to Popov. Ruslan reminds Popov to submit by 18 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015 |
| xii. Extract the Specific Criteria for Ko6 from Komi republic's presentation at the Extended SHE-Meeting and put it into the format of the Template D3.         | Not done.<br>Postponed till after MiM  |
| xiii. Extract the Specific Criteria for Ko7 from Komi republic's presentation at the Extended SHE-Meeting and put it into the format of the Template D3.        | Not done.<br>Postponed till after MiM  |
| xiv. Refine the hotspot section of the Draft Ministerial Declaration for presentation at WGE, based on the discussions at SHE 45                                | Done!  |
| xv. Submit a draft of the "Report to the Ministers" to SHE  | Done!  |

## 5. Remaining decisions on the hotspots proposed for Fast Track Exclusion

### a) A4: Novodvinsk Pulp and Paper Mill

It was concluded that a Technical (Telephone) Meeting with Russian and Nordic experts had been held on the 9<sup>th</sup> of November 2015 and that as a result of the constructive meeting, response from Arkhangelsk had been received on the 13<sup>th</sup> of November 2015. The updated information was forwarded to the Nordic experts, from which revised comments are expected till 20<sup>th</sup> of November.

At the same time it was concluded that SHE is hesitant to exclude by "Fast Track" any hot spot operating at temporary permits, so called "limits" (BДC, BДB).

### b) Ko1: Greenhouse gases from Vorkuta coal field

Due to lack of comprehensive information sufficient for expert assessment, it was decided to postpone the further assessment of Ko1 to after the Ministerial meeting

### c) Ko2-1: Vorkutinskiy Cement Plant

d) Due to lack of comprehensive information sufficient for expert assessment, it was decided to postpone the further assessment of Ko2-1 to after the Ministerial meeting

## 6. Adoption of the Final Statements for the hotspots proposed by SHE to WGE for Fast Track Exclusion

Ms Dronova explained that the hot spot owners have been invited to the Ministerial Meeting to make a 5 minutes powerpoint presentation and that Ms Dronova and Mr Mikaelsson will moderate the presentation.

Regarding the Final Statements, it was agreed to make minor adjustments as described below and to add a “disclaimer” to all statements that SHE recommendations were based only on information submitted through the Screening & Analysis reports and from the Rosprirodnadzor statements. ***It was agreed*** that Ms Nurmi will coordinate this part of the editing of the Final Statements and submit to Ms Dronova by the 17<sup>th</sup> of November 2015.

a) *A3-2: Severodvinsk Combined Heat and Power Plant No 2*

It was concluded that no additional refinements are needed.

b) *K4: Drinking Water in Petrozavodsk*

***It was agreed*** that Ms Forsström and Ms Mikaelsson add information on the output of NEFCO:s activities within the Water Management Sector in Karelia and submit to Ms Nurmi by the 16<sup>th</sup> of November 2015.

c) *Ko3-1: Mondi Syktyvkar*

***It was agreed*** that Ms Andersen adjusts the Background section of Ko3-1 in correspondence with the same section for A3-2 (regarding the split into two half- hot spots) and that Mr Butovskiy adds the comment earlier distributed by Ms Haapala. Both adjustments to be sent to Ms Nurmi by the 16<sup>th</sup> of November 2015.

## 7. Adoption on the Specific Criteria for the hotspots selected as pilots for Full Track Exclusion

Due to lack of time for an in-deep discussion of the design and application of the Specific Criteria, it was decided to postpone the adoption till after the Ministerial Meeting (MiM).

## 8. Any Other Business

No other issues were raised.

## 9. Summary of Next Steps and Task Distribution

<u>Task</u>	<u>Responsible</u>	<u>Deadline</u>
i. Re-edit the Minutes from SHE 42 from 2-3 September 2015 to a more stringent form (it was noted, concluded, decided etc.) and submit an updated version to SHE	Ruslan	30 <sup>th</sup> Nov.2015
ii. Comment on/Approve the Minutes from SHE 44 from 28 <sup>th</sup> of October 2015	Maria + Hanne	30 <sup>th</sup> Nov.2015
iii. Submit the paper on NEFCO’s activities in the Karelian energy management sector to SHE, as an input to the assessment on K7	Henrik	23 <sup>rd</sup> Nov.2015
iv. Arrange collection of secondary comments on Ko1 from the Nordic experts to be discussed at the next SHE meeting	Hanne	After MiM
v. Refine the Specific Criteria for A3-1 in accordance with the remarks collected at SHE45 and in coordination with as well Nordic Experts as with Arkhangelsk	Ruslan reminds Popov to submit by 18 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015	23 <sup>rd</sup> Nov.2015
vi. Extract the Specific Criteria for Ko6 from Komi republic’s presentation at the Extended SHE-Meeting and put it into the format of the Template D3.	Tatiana in close cooperation with Komi Republic	After MiM
vii. Extract the Specific Criteria for Ko7 from Komi republic’s presentation at the Extended SHE-Meeting and put it into the format of the Template D3.	Tatiana in close cooperation with Komi Republic	After MiM

viii. Add to the K4 Final Statement information on the output of NEFCO:s activities within the Water Management Sector in Karelia and submit to Ms Nurmi	Henrik + Åke	16 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015
ix. Adjusts the Background section of the Final Statement for Ko3-1 in correspondence with the same section for A3-2 (regarding the split into two half- hot spots) and submit to Ms Nurmi	Helén	16 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015
x. Add the comment regarding the the Final Statement for Ko3-1, earlier distributed by Ms Haapala and submit to Ms Nurmi	Ruslan	16 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015
xi. Coordinate the final adjustment of the Final Statements incl. the addition of a “disclaimer”, stating that SHE recommendations were based only on information submitted through the Screening & Analysis reports and from the Rosprirodnadzor statements, and submit to Ms Dronova.	Emma	17 <sup>th</sup> Nov 2015

### 10. Date for the Next Meeting

It was agreed that if needed, a per capsulam decision regarding A4 could be taken via e-mail prior to the Ministerial Meeting.

It was also concluded, that an administrative “catch-up meeting”, would be preferable during early December 2015.

### 11. Closure of the Meeting

The Co-chairs expressed their gratitude to all participants and declared the meeting closed.