



Minutes

55th Meeting of the Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion (SHE#55)

Meeting in Tromsø, Norway, February 28th, 2017

1. Opening of the Meeting

The meeting was opened at 09.30 and the following participated:

- Russia (Arkhangelsk Oblast: Ivan Popov, Republic of Komi: Roman Polshvedkin, Andrey Tatkov, Evgeniy Potarov and Irina Yurkovskava (phone))
- Norway (Hanne Aronsen (co-chair), Olaug Bjertnæs, Ingrid Lillehagen)
- Sweden (Åke Mikaelsson, Nadya Maslova, Elin Kronqvist, Ylva Sarden, Mats Lindell)
- Finland (Emma Nurmi, Jonas Liimatta)

and Observers:

- IBS (Maria Dianova, Sohvi Kangasluoma)
- NEFCO (Henrik G Forsström, Ruslan Butovsky, Tatiana Tiupenko (phone))

Absent: Maria Dronova, co-chair Russia

Interpreter: Boris Kochetkov

2. Adoption of the Agenda

The agenda was adopted.

3. Review of Minutes from the SHE 54 Meeting

The Minutes from SHE#54 were approved and the approved version will be circulated to the group.

4. Follow-up of tasks distributed at the previous meetings

The group went through the list of follow-up tasks from the SHE#54. Most tasks were followed up, however, some tasks were forwarded to the new list of follow-ups after SHE#55.

5. Discussion on draft Specific Exclusion Criteria for pilot hotspots Ko6, Ko7 and A3-1

- a) **Hotspot Ko7 Wood Waste in Komi – Draft Specific Exclusion Criteria presented by Tatiana Tiupenko and Roman Polshvedkin**

2(7)

Tatiana Tiupenko participated through telephone together with representatives of the Ministry of Industry, Natural Resources, Energy and Transport of the Republic of Komi and gave a presentation of the draft exclusion criteria for hotspot Ko7, which had been circulated before the meeting. A lot of environmental improvement projects have been implemented in Komi to utilize wood waste for energy recovery. Based on this Komi confirmed that they wish to seek exclusion for Ko7 from the Barents hotspot List in 2017. Komi proposes to limit the scope of the hotspot Ko7 to the 9 municipalities in the Republic of Komi that have pulp and paper and timber industry. It was discussed how to deal with the legacy wood waste and it was noted a need to address this. The group will have to come back to this.

The group thanked Tatiana Tiupenko for the thorough work on preparing a proposal of draft exclusion criteria. It was noted that the bilingual approach was highly appreciated. The draft criteria were discussed and the SHE group noted that it would be important that the criteria are precise in their wording so it will later be possible to determine if and when they are fulfilled.

The group made a clear remark that the document as drafted during the meeting to a large extent was worded as statements about what has already been achieved, rather than expressing “specific exclusion criteria” as conditions for exclusion, when relevant measures have been taken. SHE agreed that the sections describing the status of the hotspot should be removed and placed in a separate document for presenting documentation about the fulfilment of the criteria, as this would be necessary for seeking exclusion later.

After discussion the SHE group recommended to focus the exclusion criteria on 1) the utilization of the currently generated wood waste in the Republic of Komi per year for energy purposes, indicating a level of ambition of utilization of wood waste at Republic level (percentage utilized of the yearly amount of generated wood waste), 2) the compliance with Russian legislation for the residual wood waste that would not be utilized for energy purposes, and perhaps 3) about minimum level of ambition for utilizing wood waste at municipal or company levels.

Sweden/SHE will propose some revised text for Ko7 exclusion criteria for Komi to consider after the meeting.

Based on this, Komi will consider the need for further revision of the draft exclusion criteria for hotspot Ko7 and send it to SHE.

Komi may later send an application to SHE for exclusion of hotspot Ko7. The application should contain an appendix with documentation about fulfilling the exclusion criteria, (and a statement from Rosprirodnadzor recommending exclusion).

Komi was also encouraged to translate the Action Plan for utilization of wood waste into English and send it to SHE.

b) Hotspot A3-1 Arkhangelsk Heat and Power Plant#1 – Draft Specific Exclusion Criteria presented by Ruslan Butovsky (TBC)

Mr Butovsky presented the draft exclusion criteria for hotspot A3-1. The group discussed the criteria and proposed some revisions.

The group thanked Ruslan Butovsky for preparing a proposal of draft exclusion criteria for A3-1. The draft criteria were discussed and the SHE group noted that it would be important that the criteria are precise in their wording so it will later be possible to determine if and when they are fulfilled. Arkhangelsk noted that they had not seen the latest version of the draft criteria. Ruslan Butovsky will in close co-operation with Arkhangelsk MNRE and the hotspot owner of A3-1 provide a revised draft of the exclusion criteria to SHE. Butovsky will prepare a bilingual version that will be circulated to SHE as soon as it is ready.

It was recognized that there is no TEC review of the A3-1 Screening and Analysis Report. The group will have to consider this later.

c) Hotspot Ko6 Waste in Komi – Draft Specific Exclusion Criteria

- Clarify the status of the drafting of exclusion criteria for Ko6 and discussion on how to move forward with Ko6
- Decision on the way further

Ms Tiupenko informed that the Ko6 hotspot had been put on hold for a while but the work has now been resumed and Tatiana will continue developing draft exclusion criteria for Ko6 and send it to SHE in early April.

General for agenda item 5

The group agreed that there is a need to provide the Specific Exclusion Criteria both in English and Russian language. The group agreed that the specific exclusion criteria document should be bilingual during the process of development. However, when the criteria are agreed, separate English and Russian versions should be produced. It was also noted that the consultants hired for being the "hub" (co-ordinator) between the HEG and SHE in the process of developing the specific exclusion criteria, should make sure that the documents are updated in both languages and shared timely with the relevant stakeholders in SHE and HEG as appropriately when new revisions are made. The documents would also have to be marked with the date of the latest revision both in the template (footer) and in the file name of the document.

6. Hotspot A4 Arkhangelsk Pulp and Paper Mill (Novodvinsk)

This agenda item was postponed to the next SHE meeting.

It was, however, confirmed that a group of Nordic experts are going to Arkhangelsk in mid-March for meetings with relevant authorities and stakeholders including a site visit to hotspot A4. The event will be arranged in connection with a larger, climate seminar. A draft program and list of questions have been developed and submitted to Arkhangelsk MNRE for consideration. The aim of the meeting will be for the experts to get answers to outstanding questions for the TEC review of A4 in order to have a good basis for a SHE recommendation to WGE about a possible exclusion or not. It is also considered valuable for the Nordic and Russian experts to get to know each other for later reviews of other hotspots in Arkhangelsk Oblast.

Arkhangelsk MNRE confirmed that they wish for the A4 hotspot to be excluded from the hotspot list at the 2017 Ministerial.

7. Hotspot Ko2-1 Vorkuta Cement Plant

Mr Åke Mikaelsson gave a presentation about the hotspot Ko2-1 where ACAP (a working group under the Arctic Council) has been actively engaged in co-operation on environmental improvements, with main focus on dioxins but also on dust and other emissions.

Through the co-operation under ACAP the dust emissions from Vorkuta cement plant have been reduced significantly (98%) from 13,000 tonnes/year in 2007 to 240 tonnes/year in 2014. Dioxins emissions have also been measured and confirmed not to exceed international standards and the Stockholm convention on POPs emissions.

However the situation at the plant is not stable. Only one of three kilns is currently in operation. The facility is in a difficult financial situation and its future operation remains uncertain. There is a possibility that the plant may wish to proceed with co-incineration of hazardous waste, which will require a new environmental permit. Through the ACAP co-operation recommendations are provided on measures to take in order to ensure that any possible co-incineration of waste is done in an environmentally safe manner, and also in the quite relevant case if the production will be extended.

This hotspot was nearly ready for exclusion in 2015. Komi confirmed that they wish to seek exclusion for this hotspot from the Barents hotspot List at the 2017 Ministerial. SHE confirmed that this hotspot could consider seeking exclusion through either short track or long track procedure. Komi will consider which approach they would follow (short or long track) for seeking exclusion, update the S&A report and send the results and conclusions to the SHE group as soon as they are ready.

8. Hotspot Ko1 Vorkuta Coal Mines (methane)

Ms Olaug Bjertnæs gave a presentation on the information obtained by the small task force established at SHE#50 (St Petersburg) to sum up the information on Ko1 mines and report back to SHE group.

The presentation compared the emissions from the five Vorkuta coal mines comprising hot spot Ko1 with reference literature from UNECE. The Vorkuta mines are considered some of the best in Russian on capturing of methane (ca 40% capture), although, they are in the "lower" section compared to other coal mines in the world, where the best mines have up to 80% capture of methane (in Australia). It was noted that the Nordic countries' environmental authorities do not have experts on methane emission from coal mines as such and there is no EU BAT/BREF on methane emission from coal mines. Hence it is difficult for Nordic experts to review the information about Ko1 sufficiently.

Komi informed that among the five coal mines in Vorkuta, the Severnaya mine was the best equipped for capture of methane, and there is a plan to install similar equipment in the other four Vorkuta mines. Severnaya mine, however, had an accident in 2016 and is now filled with water. Further, they informed that the environmental permits for the Vorkuta coal mines currently do not contain specific target values for methane capture. There is data on capture of methane from the mines since 2009 but not earlier.

Ruslan Butovsky informed the group that a Russian BREF on methane emission from coal mines is expected by the end of 2017. He also informed that each of the five coal mines in Vorkuta is on the Russian "300-list" of companies that are pilots for implementation of the

5(7)

new BAT legislation in Russia, which indicates that it might be relevant to consider dividing the Ko1 hotspot into five sub-hotspots. This will have to be considered later.

NEFCO informed that there might be opportunities for joint implementation of greenhouse gas emission reduction projects at Vorkuta coal mines with support from new financial mechanisms under the Paris agreement. Potential projects for joint implementation under the Kyoto Protocol at the Vorkuta coal mines were investigated in a report for NEFCO in 2006.

Komi informed that they will go back and discuss with the hotspot owner how they wish to proceed with the exclusion of the hotspot Ko1, on the basis of this information. Komi agreed to report back to the SHE group about the conclusions of these discussions.

9. Support activities

This agenda item was postponed to the next SHE#56 meeting 24 March.

It was agreed that SHE members would give their comments in writing (cc to all) on an updated version to be provided by Åke Mikaelsson of the document originally circulated on 16 February, the "Proposed List of Supporting Activities", by 17 March, to ensure a good basis for discussion and possibly decision at the next SHE meeting.

It was also noted that the SE-RU proposal note about which hotspots may be given "orange colour" as illustration of progress should be circulated to SHE as soon as it is ready – with a proposal for SHE decision.

10. Outreach material

This agenda item was postponed to a later SHE meeting. SHE members are invited to give their comments and feedback on the first draft of the outreach material on Hot Spots for the Ministerial meeting, circulated by Maria Dianova 23 February 2017.

11. Report to WGE

SHE co-chair Ms Hanne Aronsen presented a draft SHE presentation intended for the WGE meeting 1 March. The group discussed the draft presentation and made some alterations to the presentation. The presentation will focus on the hotspots aiming for exclusion.

12. Template for TEC review

This agenda item was postponed to a later SHE meeting.

13. Date and Topics for Next (SHE) Meeting

The next SHE meeting (#56) will take place on 24 March, a telephone meeting at 09.00-11.00 (Oslo-time). Main topics for discussion will be 1) Support Activities and 2) Outreach for the Ministerial.

A draft agenda for the SHE#56 meeting will be circulated by the Chair.

14. Summary of Next Steps and Distribution of Tasks

Task	<i>Responsible</i>	<i>Deadline</i>
1. Circulate draft Minutes from SHE#55	Hanne	asap
2. Comments on draft Minutes from SHE#55	All	17 March
3. Ko7: Sweden/SHE will propose some revised text on specific exclusion criteria for Komi to consider	Hanne	asap
4. Ko7: Komi will consider the need for further revision of the draft exclusion criteria for hotspot Ko7 and send it to SHE	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
5. Ko7: Komi will translate the Action Plan for utilization of wood waste into English and send it to SHE (step 4)	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
6. Ko7: Komi may later, after SHE approval of the Action plan (step 5), send a report on completed implementation of the action plan (step 6) send an application to SHE for exclusion of hotspot Ko7 (step 7) including the necessary documentation and a statement from Rosprirodnadzor	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
7. A3-1: Arkhangelsk will provide a revised draft of the exclusion criteria for A3-1. Butovsky will co-ordinate and prepare a bilingual version that will be circulated to SHE as soon as it is ready	Arkhangelsk/Ruslan Butovsky	asap
8. Ko6: Komi will continue developing draft exclusion criteria for Ko6 and send it to SHE.	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap (Early April)
9. Ko2-1: Komi will consider which approach they would follow (short or long track) for seeking exclusion, update the S&A report and report back to SHE about the results and conclusions as soon as they are ready	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
10. Ko1: Komi will discuss with the hotspot owner how they wish to proceed with the exclusion of the hotspot Ko1 and report back to the SHE group about the conclusions of these discussions.	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
11. Åke Mikaelsson will update and SHE members will comment on the document "Proposed list of Supporting Activities", originally circulated on 16 February.	Åke Mikaelsson All (SHE)	asap 17 March
12. Circulate the SE-RU proposal note about which hotspots may be given "orange colour".	Åke/Maria Dronova	asap
13. SHE members are invited to give their comments and feedback on the first draft of the outreach material on Hot Spots for the Ministerial meeting, circulated by Maria Dianova 23 February 2017	All (SHE)	17 March
14. Circulate 1 st draft agenda for the SHE#56 telephone meeting 24 March	Hanne	asap
15. Comments and input on draft agenda for the SHE#56 meeting	All	1 week
16. Provide updated proposal on "pool" of experts and consultants	Henrik	17 March

15. Any Other Business

No other business

7(7)

16. Closure of the Meeting

The meeting was closed at 17.20