



Minutes

58th Meeting of the Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion (SHE#58)

Moscow, May 22-23, 2017

1. Opening of the Meeting

The meeting started 09.00 on 22 May with preparations for the meeting between the SHE group and the BAT Bureau. The SHE meeting continued 23 May. The following participated:

- Russia (Maria Dronova, co-chair)
- Norway (Hanne Aronsen, co-chair)
- Sweden (Åke Mikaelsson, Bo Johansson, Sofia Rantatalo (23 May only))
- Finland (Emma Nurmi)

and Observers:

- IBS (Maria Dianova)
- NEFCO (Alexander Boldyrev, Ruslan Butovsky (consultant), Tatiana Tiupenko (consultant))

Absent: Henrik G Forsström (NEFCO)

2. Adoption of the Agenda

The agenda was adopted with the addition of a discussion of the draft statement of hotspot A4, inserted between agenda item 8 and 9. Some items under AOB.

3. Review of Minutes from the SHE 57 Meeting

The Minutes from SHE#57 meeting were approved intersessionally (28 April) and translated into Russian. The approved version was circulated to the group 9 May, in English and Russian.

4. Follow-up of tasks distributed at SHE#57

The group went through the updated list of follow-up tasks from the minutes of the SHE#57 meeting. The following tasks were completed and subsequently deleted from the list of follow-ups;

- Follow-up 4, Tatiana Tiupenko has translated the action plan for hotspot Ko7 (called Road Map) into English. The Road Map was circulated to the SHE group 21 May 2017.

- Follow-up 7, Ruslan Butovsky has discussed the draft specific exclusion criteria for A3-1 with Ivan Popov in Arkhangelsk and prepared a bilingual version. According to Mr Popov this hotspot is not ready for exclusion. Before the draft exclusion criteria is circulated to SHE, Maria Dronova will check with Mr Ivan Popov if the version of the draft criteria is OK. If OK, the SHE group will ask Nordic experts for comments on the draft criteria.
- Follow-up 10, Tatiana Tiupenko reported to SHE#58 about how Komi wish to proceed with hotspot Ko1, Ko2-1, Ko3-2, Ko6, Ko7 and Ko8. (see SHE#58 minutes, item 8).
- Follow-up 14, Swedish and Finnish experts have prepared a mission report from the meetings in Arkhangelsk in March 2017 about hotspot A4 the Arkhangelsk Pulp and Paper Mill Novodvinsk (circulated to SHE group 11 May 2017 by Olaug Bjertnaes).
- Follow-up 15, The TEC review of hotspot A4 (APPM) has been updated (circulated to SHE 11 May 2017 by Olaug Bjertnaes).
- Follow-up 16, Hanne has talked to Mr Ivan Popov about the update of the Screening&Analysis report for hotspot A4 (5 April 2017). Mr Popov confirmed that Arkhangelsk does not plan to update the Screening and Analysis report for hotspot A4.
- Follow-up 17, Hanne Aronsen has prepared a first draft SHE statement about the exclusion of hotspot A4 (APPM). The draft statement was circulated to SHE 17 May 2017,
- Follow-up 18, Ruslan Butovsky has found a possible date for a meeting between SHE and the Moscow BAT Bureau (meeting 22 May 2017).
- Follow-up 19, NEFCO has translated the consultant mission report from meetings with hotspot owners in Komi (circulated to SHE 10 April 2017 by Henrik G. Forsström)

The rest of the tasks were updated and forwarded to the new list of follow-ups after SHE#58 along with new tasks for follow-up.

5. Support activities

The group discussed the List of support activities and decided on a last round of comments before the list is approved as a first version of the living document. Deadline for comments 9 June.

6. Preparations for the meeting with the BAT Bureau (22 May)

The group discussed preparations for the meeting with the BAT Bureau. The aim of the meeting is primarily to inform the BAT-Bureau about the SHE-work, but also to discuss possible synergies and possibilities for cooperation. For SHE it will be useful to get clarification on: 1) How can SHE/Nordic countries contribute to the BAT seminars? (International perspective?) and 2) How can the BAT seminars contribute to the work of SHE (Hotspot exclusion)?

22 May 12.00-14.30:

Meeting between SHE and the BAT Bureau about possible synergies (22 May)

Participants; Emma Nurmi (Finland), Tatiana Tiupenko (consultant), Bo Johansson (Sweden), Maria Dianova (IBS), Ilya Kuroshev (BAT Bureau), Vera Koslaleva (BAT Bureau), Dmitry Toschef (BAT Bureau), Åke Mikaelsson (Sweden), Viktoriya Kovalenko

(BAT Bureau), Tatiana Guseva (BAT Bureau), ?, Ruslan Butovsky (consultant), Maria Dronova (Russia), Hanne Aronsen (Norway), Alexander Boldyrev (NEFCO).

The SHE group presented its work on the exclusion of hotspots. The Moscow BAT Bureau informed about their work on developing BREFs and on education and awareness raising. The BAT Bureau was established in 2015 and has till now developed 21 BREFs and 28 more will be developed and finalized in 2017 (total 51). In addition they have developed;

- training program webinars (2-3 hours) for regional authorities about (BAT or IEP or both?) – cost efficient*
- Role play modules for branch/sector wise BAT training for enterprises (2-3 days) – requires an invitation/request from an enterprise willing to host and do preparation work*

The BAT Bureau currently has more limited resources than earlier to do training programs. From 2019 the 300 major polluters in Russia (category 1 enterprises) will have to apply for an integrated Environmental Permit (including BAT compliance), and an IEP for these should be issued at the latest by the end of 2022. After 2022 also other enterprises will have to apply for IEP.

Both parties noted synergies and the BAT Bureau expressed interest in cooperation with SHE. They were especially interested in international experience on the application for IEP, which the Nordic countries have. SHE also has good contact with the Barents regions, including environmental authorities and (hotspot) enterprises, which could be useful for identifying objects for training activities. SHE expressed their interest in connecting the development of hotspot exclusion criteria to implementation of IEP, including BAT. The BAT Bureau asked SHE to sum up the meeting in a 10 line note. Åke Mikaelson will follow-up on this and circulate a draft to SHE before it is sent to the BAT Bureau.

23 May 09.00 – SHE meeting continues

7. Reflections after the meeting with the BAT Bureau

The group discussed how to follow up after the meeting with the BAT Bureau. It was recognized that the process on applying for and issuing integrated environmental permits (IEP) may be an important tool also in the hotspot exclusion process, perhaps even more relevant to SHE than BAT/BREF alone, especially since the MNRE is in charge of the IEPs. To follow-up, the group decided to establish a Task force (Åke Mikaelsson, HenrikForsström, Ruslan Butovsky and Maria Dianova) on the cooperation between SHE and the BAT Bureau. Hopefully the cooperation can result in one or several Hotspot support activities. The task force will report back to SHE as soon as there is proposal for a concrete support activity. Relevant input from the Nordic countries could be on the experience on relevant content for application for an integrated environmental permits (IEP).

Ruslan Butovsky will update the list of "Hotspots versus BAT/BREF" and also include information on which hotspots are on the Russian "300 list" (the 300 greatest polluters), and send to SHE and to the BAT Bureau.

8. Status for the Komi hotspots seeking exclusion

Tatiana Tiupenko presented the Komi hotspots;

Ko1 – Methane emissions from coal mines in Vorkuta (5 mines). The hotspot is aiming for exclusion in 2017. An updated S&A report and a statement from Rosprirodnadzor has been prepared and submitted to Maria Dronova in the Federal Russian MNRE. Dronova will circulate this to SHE as soon as possible. Dronova confirms that the Federal MNRE wish to exclude this hotspot from the list. Each of the 5 mines are on the list of the 300 greatest polluters in Russia, however as individual objects. Ms. Tiupenko confirms that the hotspot owner does not wish to split the hotspot into 5 sub hotspots (has been discussed). Since the Nordic environmental authorities have limited expertise on methane emission from coal mines, the SHE group decided to ask NEFCO to hire a consultant by the end of June 2017 to do an expert review by the middle of August of the received information in the S&A for Ko1. Hanne Aronsen agreed to prepare a draft task description for a consultant, based on the same task description as the technical expert committee comprised by Nordic experts would otherwise follow (TEC guidelines as agreed by SHE in 2017). The draft task description will be circulated to SHE by the end of May for comments by short deadline. If appropriate, the same consultants could also review S&A from Ko8 later.

Ko2-1 – Dust emissions from Vorkuta cement plant. The dust emissions have been significantly reduced and the hotspot could be subject for as well fast track as full track exclusion. Due to internal issues at the owner, not related to the hot spot work, the plant is closed since 1 January 2017 and any decision on from the further steps in relation to the Barents hotspot list will have to take await the further decisions of the owner whether to re-start the operations or not). (Documentation: S&A report from April 2013. ACAP reports from 2017. No TEC review yet)

Ko3-2 – Waste water from Mondi Pulp and Paper Mill in Syktyvkar. The Ko3-1 (emission to air) is already excluded. Ms. Tatiana Tiupenko will ask the hotspot owner to prepare an updated S&A for the waste water part (Ko3-2), including implemented measures and plans for environmental improvements. This hotspot is considered relevant for long track exclusion (although not a formal SHE conclusion on this yet) and may also be a candidate for a possible support activity like a seminar on IEP training in cooperation with the BAT Bureau.

Ko6 – Waste in Komi. Progress has been made on waste management by the Ministry in Komi, but there is still more work to do. A S&A report has been prepared and circulated to SHE (e-mail 19 May 2017 from Maria Dronova). A TEC review will be the next step in the exclusion procedure. This hotspot is considered relevant for long track exclusion (although not a formal SHE conclusion on this yet).

Ko7 – wood waste in Komi. This hotspot is aiming for exclusion in 2017. Considerable environmental improvements have been made. An updated S&A report was prepared in 2016 and a road map for further environmental improvements have been submitted to SHE. A TEC review is missing and should be prepared as soon as possible. The Nordic countries will decide among themselves who will coordinate. Specific exclusion criteria is under development. Åke will send Nordic comments to the draft criteria to Tatiana Tiupenko as soon as possible. Tiupenko will include the use of the remaining 40% of the wood waste (the wood waste not used as energy) in the criteria. In parallel, the Nordic countries will nominate experts for the TEC review with the aim to have a (speedy) TEC review ready by the end of June 2017. Tiupenko will also forward to SHE a letter from Rosprirodnadzor regarding the exclusion of hotspot Ko7.

Ko8 – Coal mining waste in Komi. Screening and Analyses report (S&A) has been prepared and is circulated to SHE (e-mail 19 May 2017 from Maria Dronova). This hotspot aims for long track exclusion. An expert review of the S&A report is the next step. It might be relevant to engage an international consultant to do the TEC review as the Nordic environmental authorities have limited expertise on this topic. Like for Ko1.

Possible SHE meeting in Syktyvkar: Tatiana Tiupenko informed SHE that the Ministry of Industry, Natural Resources, Energy and Transport of the Komi Republic is interested in inviting the SHE group to have a meeting in Syktyvkar in October 2017. The SHE group decided to discuss this in their next telephone meeting in June and get back to Komi on this issue.

8'. Hotspot A4 Arkhangelsk Pulp and Paper Mill Novodvinsk

Maria Dronova informed SHE that a letter has been sent from Arkhangelsk to the Federal MNRE after the expert visit in March 2017. information will be translated into English and circulated to SHE. The Region (Arkhangelsk) supports exclusion of hotspot A4 as a whole. The Nordic countries has so far concluded on a partial exclusion of the wastewater part (A4-2), but not exclusion of the emission to air part (A4-1). A draft statement based on the Nordic conclusion has been circulated to SHE as a 1st draft (circulated to SHE 19 May 2017 by Hanne Aronsen). Maria Dronova will make sure the draft SHE statement is translated into Russian by 26 May and discuss it with the A4 hotspot owner and regional environmental authorities in Arkhangelsk and give feedback to SHE through a revised (2nd draft) statement for hotspot A4 in English no later than the morning of 2 June. The Nordic countries will discuss the revised statement (possibly through phone meeting) and prepare a final SHE statement by 6 June that is submitted to the WGE chair 7 June.

Maria Dronova added later: The draft final statement, refined by Nordic experts considering the additional information from Arkhangelsk (A4) will be translated into Russian and sent to Rospriridnadzor for further consideration (for getting official stance).

9. Preparations for the 2017 Barents Environment Ministerial Meeting

Maria Dronova informed about the preparations for the Ministerial meeting. Dronova had prepared draft text for the 2017 Ministerial declaration before the SHE#58 meeting but there was no time to discuss this during the meeting. The group agreed to send comments to Dronova on the draft text by the end of June 2017.

10. Outreach material for the 2017 Ministerial

Maria Dianova showed examples on leaflets for outreach on hotspots. As no decisions on exclusion have been made yet, text for leaflets has not been produced. The SHE group appreciated the drafts presented and agreed to have focus on this in its Autumn meeting. It was emphasised that the Hotspot owners should be involved in producing/approving the text for the leaflets.

11. Report from the HEG meeting in Murmansk

A report from the HEG meeting in Murmansk has been drafted by Maria Dianova and will be circulated to SHE for comments. During the meeting several hotspots seemed to be

aiming for exclusion. The SHE message was that time is short and information on applying for exclusion should be sent to SHE as soon as possible in order to be considered for exclusion before the 2017 Ministerial. So far, SHE has not received anything from the Murmansk hotspots. Maria Dronova will check with Murmansk what the status is for the Murmansk hotspots and clarify if the hotspot owners are waiting for something from SHE.

12. Date and Topics for Next (SHE) Meeting

The group decided to hold the next SHE meeting (SHE#59) as a telephone/web meeting 21 June at 09.00 Oslo/Stockholm time/10.00 Helsinki/Moscow time. In that meeting a possible SHE meeting in Syktyvkar in Komi in October 2017 (end September/beginning October) will be discussed, and the SHE co-chairs will give a reply to Komi on the conclusions afterwards.

13. Summary of Next Steps and Distribution of Tasks

Task	<i>Responsible</i>	<i>Deadline</i>
1. Circulate draft Minutes from SHE#58	Hanne	asap
2. Comments on draft Minutes from SHE#58	All	(1 week) 5 June
3. A3-1: Check with Mr Ivan Popov in Arkhangelsk if the draft specific exclusion criteria for A3-1 is OK and ready for circulation for comments. Then circulate for comments.	Maria Dronova	
4. List of support activities. Send comments	All	9 June
5. Update the list of "Hotspots versus BAT/BREF" and send to SHE and to the BAT Bureau.	Ruslan Butovsky	asap
6. Task force on SHE cooperation with BAT Bureau – report back to SHE on possible support activities in cooperation with BAT Bureau	Åke Mikaelsson	
7. Ko1: Circulate the updated S&A report to SHE	Maria Dronova	asap
8. Ko1: Hire a consultant to do an expert review of the updated S&A report for Ko1. The consultant review should be finalized and submitted from NEFCO to SHE by Mid August.	NEFCO/Henrik Forsström	30 June / 15 August
9. Ko1: Prepare a draft task description for a consultant to do the expert review of the S&A report for Ko1 for a quick round of comments in SHE	Hanne Aronsen	31 May
10. Ko1: Give comments on the draft task description for a consultant to do the expert review of the S&A report for hotspot Ko1	All	8 June
11. Ko3-2: Prepare an updated S&A for the waste water part (Ko3-2) of the Mondi hotspot	Komi/ Tatiana Tiupenko	
12. Ko6: Prepare a TEC review of the S&A report for Ko6	Nordic experts	After 2017 Ministerial?
13. Ko6: Komi will continue developing draft exclusion criteria for Ko6 and send it to SHE	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	
14. Ko7: Åke will clean up the draft specific	Åke Mikaelsson	asap

exclusion criteria for Ko7, including the Nordic comments and send to Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko		
15. Ko7: Komi will consider the need for further revision of the draft exclusion criteria, including inserting a reference to the use of the wood waste not utilized for energy purposes, from hotspot Ko7 and send it to SHE	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
16. Ko7. Komi may later, following a possible SHE approval of the Action plan (step 5), send a report on completed implementation of the action plan (step 6) send an application (request?) to SHE for exclusion of hotspot Ko7 (step 7) including the necessary documentation and a statement from Rosprirodnadzor	Komi/Tatiana Tiupenko	asap
17. Ko7: Forward to SHE a letter from Rosprirodnadzor regarding the exclusion of hotspot Ko7	Maria Dronova	asap
18. Ko7: Nordic countries will (nominate experts and) prepare a TEC review about Ko7	Mikaelsson, Nurmi, Aronsen	30 June
19. Ko8: Consider to hire a consultant to do a TEC review of the S&A report for Ko8	NEFCO/Henrik Forsström	After 2017 Ministerial?
20. A4: Make sure the draft SHE statement about hotspot A4 is translated into Russian.	Maria Dronova	26 May
21. A4: Send a revised SHE statement about A4 to SHE (2 nd draft in English with marked new text and with new date), after discussing it with the A4 hotspot owner and regional environmental authorities in Arkhangelsk	Maria Dronova	1 June
22. A4: Discuss the 2 nd draft (revised) SHE statement about hotspot A4 and come to a conclusion based on the Russian comments (possibly through phone meeting) and prepare a final SHE statement	Nordic SHE members. Norway will coordinate	6 June
23. A4: Submit final SHE statement about hotspot A4 to the WGE chair	Hanne Aronsen	7 June
24. 2017 Ministerial declaration. Send comments to Maria Dronova (cc all) on the draft text for the Ministerial declaration	All	30 June
25. Outreach material for 2017 Ministerial: Continue to prepare a first draft leaflet to SHE on hotspots	Maria Dianova	
26. Murmansk HEG meeting (3 March 2017). Circulate draft report to SHE for comments	Maria Dianova	
27. Murmansk hotspots. Check with Murmansk what the status for the Murmansk hotspots is and clarify if the hotspot owners are waiting for something from SHE.	Maria Dronova	
28. Comments on the circulated SE-RU proposal note about which hotspots may be given "orange colour".	All (SHE)	15 June

29. Send out invitation for the SHE#59 meeting	Hanne Aronsen	30 May
30. Circulate 1 st draft agenda for the SHE#59 meeting	Hanne Aronsen	7 June
31. Comments and input on draft agenda for the SHE#59 meeting	All	1 week 14 June
32. Give feedback to Komi about a possible SHE meeting in Syktyvkar in end of September or beginning of October 2017	SHE co-chairs	30 June

14. Any Other Business

Finland informed about Saija Vuola in the Finnish Ministry of Environment who will temporarily be the new Finnish SHE representative when Emma Nurmi is on leave and also be WGE representative. Helena Dahlbo from SYKE will follow up the Finnish Barents/Arctic waste project and other experts from SYKE might be available from case to case for TEC reviews on hotspots.

Regarding the proposed meeting between SHE country representatives and WGE about hotpot A4 on 19 June, the SHE members confirmed their participation.

15. Closure of the Meeting

The meeting was closed at 16.30.