

Minutes

70th Meeting of the BEAC WGE Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion, (SHE#70)

Telephone, 25th of September, 2018

1. Opening of the Meeting

The meeting was opened and attended by the following participants:

- Mr Åke Mikaelsson, Chair, SE
- Mr Rickard Nätjehall, SE
- Mr Alexander Druchinin, Co-Chair, RU*
- Ms Helena Dahlbo, FI
- Ms Anne Marie Mo Ravik, NO
- Ms Olaug Bjertnaes, NO
- Ms Julia Bobina, IBS
- Mr Ruslan Butovskiy, NEFCO
- Mr Henrik Forsström, NEFCO

(*could not attend, but submitted information and positions)

2. Adoption of the Agenda

The agenda was adopted minor changes:

- i. The issue on the project proposals from NAO should be addressed only under item 6a (originally addressed also under 5c).
- ii. The project proposal from the Arkhangelsk HEG on Oil Contamination, SHE#70.6aⁱⁱ, was added to the agenda.

3. Follow-up of tasks distributed at the previous meetings (SHE#69)

The delegate assigned responsible gave a brief up-date of the findings as well as the extent of completion of their respective task:

Task	Responsible	Status
i. Finalize the reimbursement contracts and inform the regions about the financial/procedural reimbursements for travel and accommodation.	Henrik	Done! (2 contracts)
ii. Send out contact information to Ms Julia Bobina to the whole SHE-group	Roman/Julia	Done!
iii. Review the proposed sub-steps for Step 3-7 in the SHE Progress Sheet and approves/comments till the next meeting	Alexander	Not Done!
iv. Develop a Draft ToR for a Supporting Activity No6 – “Refinement of Screening & Analysis Report and Development of Specific Exclusion Criteria” for the hotspot N3 - Wastewater in Naryan-Mar	Henrik + Yana	Done!
v. Provide a gathered summary table on S&A;s etc and the hot spots for which TEC experts and any kind of response is required.	Åke	Not Done!
vi. Ask Tatiana Guseva regarding possibilities for remote attention at No1a on the 26th of September 2018	Ruslan	Done!

vii. Contact Yan for details before responding to the regions.	Alexander	Done!
viii. Distribute to SHE Arkhangelsk HEG's Letter on A7, incl. interest in No2, No3, No4	Åke	Done! (see SHE#70.5aii)
ix. Distribute to SHE Maria's and Åke's thinking paper on the refined Hot Spots Exclusion Procedure	Åke	Done! (see SHE#70.7a)
x. Up-date suggested refinement of the SHE Mandate (as in SHE#69)	Henrik	Done! (see SHE#70.8a)
xi. Arrange a Skype meeting on Ko3-2 with Tatiana Tiupenko, Alexander, Åke, Julia.	Åke	Not Done!
xii. Find experts for taking lead and starting to carry out the TEC review on Ko1 and Ko8 together with possible Nordic expert(s). (Pending info from Mr Litvak)	Henrik	Not Done!
xiii. Distribute BEAC CSO Recommendations on Communications to whole SHE	Roman/Julia	Done!
xiv. Appoint experts for the drafting of ToR for Support Activities (combinations of No2, No4, No4, No5, No6) for Water and Wastewater	Alexander, Helena, Åke	Done! (FI, SE) Not Done (RU)
xv. Appoint experts for the drafting of ToR for Support Activities (combinations of No2, No4, No4, No5, No6) for Pulp & Paper Industry	Alexander, Helena, Åke	Done! (FI) Not Done (SE, RU)

4. Review of Minutes from previous meetings

The minutes from SHE #69 were approved with the inclusion of minor comments from Finland under the headline '*App SHE#70.4 - Draft Minutes SHE#69 (rev) - Telephone 30Aug2018_FI*'.

5. Communication with the Regional Hotspot Exclusion Groups (Regional HEGs)

a) Review of the up-dated Screening & Analysis reports submitted by the Arkhangelsk HEG

- i) A5 – Kotlas PPM (ILLIM Koryazhma): Olaug reported that Norway had reviewed the report and find it well prepared both from structure and content, much better than previous S&A Reports submitted. The general assessment so far indicates the hot spot well satisfying both Russian and EU BREFs. It was concluded that neither FI nor SE had reviewed the report.

It was agreed that FI+SE has to appoint relevant experts for review and that the final SHE assessment should be done by the End of October 2018.

- ii) A7 – Russkaya Arktika (redefined): It was concluded that Norway had reviewed also this report while FI+SE had not. Olaug reported that unlike the previous report, the S&A report for A7 is less clear and with poor consistency: inter alia there are comparancy problems with data comparing different units, e.g. barrels vs. tons). The scope of A7 deals with a mix of hazardous waste problems and contaminated grounds, for which both FI+SE deem they have experts but no one so far appointed (SE indicating, again, availability problems with experts).

It was agreed that FI and SE appoints experts for commenting on the S&A report for A7 and that TEC-comments are prepared for by the End of October 2018.

- iii) A9a – Dioxins from Arkhangelsk PPM: Again it was concluded that Norway, but neither FI nor SE had reviewed the report. Olaug reported that Norway is satisfied with the achievements and that elementary chlorine discharges are below EU BAT levels.

It was agreed that TEC-comments for A9a are prepared by the End of October 2018.

- iv) A9b – Dioxins from ILLIM Pulp in Koryazhma: Also here Olaug reported that Norway is satisfied with the achievements and that elementary chlorine discharges are below EU BAT levels.

It was agreed that TEC-comments for A9a are prepared by the End of October 2018.

- b) Regarding the HEG's responses on SHE's Letter to HEG's "On exclusion priorities and preferences for supporting activities" it was concluded that all five HEGs had responded sufficiently with constructive suggestions for further supporting activities in the respective region as well as for further hot spot work in general, see summary below:

HEG	Preferred Support Activities	Preferred Branches for No2 & No3	Preferred Enterprises for No4 and No5	Other
i. Arkhangelsk	No1b: BAT-Training in the region No2: Branch Seminar No3: StudyTour	Pulp & Paper Wastewater	(None)	Fast track for A5 - Koryahma A7 – Russkaya Arktika A9a – Dioxins Novodvinsk A9b – Dioxins at Koryazhma
ii. Karelia	No6: Enhanced S&A and Specific Criteria	Pulp & Paper Wastewater	K4: Kondopoga PPM + Segezha PPM (No HS) K5: Petrozavodsk WWTP	Fast track proposed for K5: Petrozavodsk WWTP K7: Oil & Coal Boilers Focused efforts on K2: Nadvoitsy AluSmelter
iii. Komi		Waste	Ko2-2: Vorkuta HPP Ko3-1: Mondi	FI ready to apply for Funding for Ko6. *, **
iv. Murmansk	No1b: BAT-Training in the region No2: Branch Seminar No4: EnhEnvPerfPlan No5: Permit Exercise No6: S&A + Spec.Crit No7: Action Planning No8: Action Impl.	Mining Metallurgy	M3: OAO Apatit M5: Kovdorskij GOK	
v. Nenets AO	No1b: BAT-Training in the region No2: Branch Seminar No3: StudyTour No6: Enhanced S&A and Specific Criteria for N3	Wastewater	N3: Naryan-Mar WWTP	

*) Finland will seek funding to continue the ongoing AB-WASTE project. When designing the contents of the future project, the interests of Komi for e.g. information exchange on waste management can be considered

**) Finland would like to get information on the activities currently performed on waste management in Komi by Norway.

- c) The Chair informed about the preparations for the Support Activity No1a – Introduction Seminar to BAT and Hotspots - taking place at the Russian BAT-Bureau on the 26th of

September 2018: Some 40 delegates will participate in person and others via link. There is a good representation for as well the central level Rosprirodnadzor as relevant people from the regions and also relevant industry or branch representatives. Also SHE members were invited to participate. Åke will hold a presentation and introduction to the exercise.

It was agreed that if the seminar is successful and results a plan for further events/follow-up seminars, a plan for this will be drafted, based on a follow-up discussion to be held by the Chair, the BAT-Bureau and NEFCO the day after the seminar. This Draft Plan on Further Implementation of the Support Activities will be presented to the SHE a.s.a.p. after the meeting for approval/adjustments. It was further agreed that Henrik will send a slide to Åke about NEFCO that he can present to the Russian managers

- d) Decision on further communication/meeting appointments with the HEGs
- i) SHE's further action on the refined definition of the Arkhangelsk hotspots: Åke will discuss with Mr Ivan Popov for possible further needs or expectations. Otherwise no action needed.
 - ii) Regarding SHE's further action on SHE's "Letter to HEGs on priorities and preferences", it was agreed that in follow of the No1a seminar, an assessment takes place with the BAT-Bureau on the 27th of September 2018. Based on this discussion, the BAT-Bureau will be requested to elaborate and submit to SHE:
 - A draft plan for SHE Support Activities to be provided to the respective federation subjects and branches as well as a draft time frame. Where possible, include consultants that will be included.
 - Draft letters to the HEGs on what supporting activities that SHE offers to them. The letters should be disseminated by the End of October.
 - iii) Regarding SHE's further action to implement the Support Activities No1a and No1b, it was agreed the Chair makes a background presentation on the hotspot history and its conjunction with BAT and the FZ-219. It was further agreed that the Chair also will emphasize the expectation and encourage the HEGs to prepare for holding No1b seminars in their respective regions within a close future.

6. Decision on further steps with the Support Activities

- a) Approval of the ToRs for Support Activities:
- i) No6 (N3) – "Refinement of Screening & Analysis Report and Development of Specific Exclusion Criteria" for the hotspot N3

The draft document submitted by NAO via NEFCO (without refinement) to SHE was discussed and found good in substance but poor in structure. It needs to be significantly revised to meet requirements for a ToR good enough for NEFCO to engage consultants.

It was suggested that Henrik, as originally intended, contacts Yana Voitsekhovskaya in NAO for coaching talks around a relevant ToR template. Once done, TEC experts should review and comment on it prior to approval.
 - ii) Draft ToR on a "Branch-Specific Seminars for capacity building on Russian BREFs, BAT and BEPin the field of oil contamination and remediation"

Henrik explained that NEFCO is already in contact with several different remediation initiatives in the region and a proposal has been produced on how the SHE support

activity for this could be made (submitted close before the meeting). This proposal was also thought to be applicable to other regions with similar contamination issues.

It was agreed that the countries appoint TEC experts for review and comment by the end of October 2018.

b) Decision on Appointments of Experts for the ToR Elaboration Task Forces for:

- i) The following experts were appointed to coach the elaboration and implementation of Support Activities on Water and Wastewater treatment:

FI: Mr Jyrki Laitinen from SYKE, Jyrki.laitinen@ymparisto.fi

SE: Ms Kristina Svinhufvud from SwEPA, Kristina.svinhufvud@naturvardsverket.se

(Alexander is still to propose expert(s) from the Russian side)

- ii) The following experts were appointed to coach the elaboration and implementation of Support Activities on Pulp and Paper Industry:

FI: Mr Timo Jouttijärvi from SYKE, Jyrki.laitinen@ymparisto.fi

NO: Ms Olaug Bjertnaes, NEA. Olaug.bjertnaes@miljodir.no

SE: Mr Bo Jansson and Mr Anders Törngren from SwEPA (internal consultations follow)
(Alexander is still to propose expert(s) from the Russian side)

c) Decision on further Support Activities to develop further to ToR:

It was agreed to wait for the Draft Plan for Support Activities to be submitted to SHE by the Russian BAT-Bureau, based on the discussion to follow after the No1a Seminar.

7. Review of administration and up-date of the Progress Sheet

- a) Regarding the refined Sub-steps under Steps 3-7 of the HSE Procedure It was concluded that any SHE now only awaits Russia's approval.
- b) Regarding the up-date of the Progress Sheet – inter alia in accordance with the suggestions from the Arkhangelsk HEG and Murmansk HEG the approval should be taken jointly with 7a)
Decisions were thus tabled to next meeting

8. WGE and Communication Issues

- a) Approval of the up-dated SHE Mandate

It was agreed that the updated SHE mandated as submitted by NEFCO should be accepted by silent procedure within a week after the meeting, i.e. that unless comments or further revised versions arise by the 2nd of October, the up-dated SHE Mandate should be regarded approved by SHE and submitted to WGE.

- b) The BEAC CSO Communication Strategy and decisions on relevant communication initiatives for SHE, contributing to the Strategy

It was agreed that Julia and Roman at the IBS will have another look at it and make some changes where deemed relevant. Julia will elaborate on this topic at the next SHE meeting.

9. Any Other Business

Henrik informed about the 3rd call for proposals for Kolarctic CBC Program having its deadline for submission of project proposals on the 21st of December 2018. Possible coordination with the Barents cooperation could be made, also using inter alia the Arctic Project Trust Fund.

It was agreed that NEFCO will send some additional information about the Kolarctic CBC Program and conditions for the 3rd call for proposals.

10. Summary of Next Steps and Distribution of Tasks

Task	Responsible	Deadline
i. Discuss with Ivan Popov on additional steps with Arkhangelsk HEG	Åke	25 th of September
ii. Initiate (and execute) the elaboration of a Draft Plan for SHE Support Activities, based on follow-up talks with the BAT-Bureau and NEFCO after the No1a seminar.	Åke, Henrik BAT-Bureau	26 th of September 6 th of October
iii. Initiate (and execute) the drafting of a SHE response Letter to the HEGs regarding further implementation of SHE Support Activities in the regions.	Åke, Henrik BAT-Bureau	26 th of September 6 th of October
iv. Elaborate draft ToR:s on selected Support Activities for the regions, No1b, No2+3, No4+5, etc.	BAT-Bureau	6 th of October
v. Comment and/or approve the updated SHE mandate as submitted by NEFCO	All	6 th of October
vi. Provide information about the Kolarctic CBC Programme to the SHE group	Henrik	6 th of October
vii. Review of the BEAC CSO Communication Strategy and decisions on relevant communication initiatives for SHE, contributing to the Strategy	Julia	15 th of October
viii. Review the proposed sub-steps for Step 3-7 in the SHE Progress Sheet and approves/comments till the next meeting	Alexander	15 th of October
ix. Provide a gathered summary table on S&A;s etc and the hot spots for which TEC experts and any kind of response is required	Åke	15 th of October
x. Arrange a Skype meeting on Ko3-2 with Tatiana Tiupenko, Alexander, Åke, Julia.	Åke	15 th of October
xi. Contact Ms Yana Voitsekhovskaya in NAO for coaching talks around a relevant ToR template, thus initiating the re-drafting of the proposed SuppAct No3 on N3	Henrik	15 th of October
xii. Appoint experts for the drafting of ToR for Support Activities (combinations of No2, No4, No4, No5, No6) for Water and Wastewater	Alexander, Åke	15 th of October
xiii. Appoint experts for the drafting of ToR for Support Activities (combinations of No2, No4, No4, No5, No6) for Pulp & Paper Industry	Alexander, Åke	15 th of October
xiv. Prepare TEC comments for revised Screening & Analysis Report on A5	All	26 th of October
xv. Prepare TEC comments for revised Screening & Analysis Report on A7	All	26 th of October
xvi. Prepare TEC comments for revised Screening & Analysis Report on A9a	All	26 th of October
xvii. Prepare TEC comments for revised Screening & Analysis Report on A9b	All	26 th of October
xviii. Submit TEC comments on A5, A7, A9a and A9b to Arkhangelsk HEG	Alexander	26 th of October
xix. Approve and submit SHE response Letters to HEGs on Further Support Activities	SHE, Alexander	26 th of October
xx. Appoint TEC experts for review and comments on the proposed ToR for a No2 on "Oil contamination and remediation"	All	31 st of October

11. Next Meeting

After a somewhat abrupt closing just before this agenda item, the time for the next meeting was agreed via e-mail, finally concluding that **SHE#71 will be held on the 15th of October 2018 at 13.00 – 15.00 CET/ 14.00 – 16.00 MT by Telephone.**

12. Closure of the Meeting

The meeting was closed around 17.00 CET (since the premises at the BAT-Bureau had to be evacuated).

Final List of Appendices:

- App SHE#70.4 - Minutes from SHE#69
- App SHE#70.5ai - Screening Analysis A5 En
- App SHE#70.5aii - Screening Analysis A7 (rev29May2018) En
- App SHE#70.5aiii - Screening Analysis A9a_APPM En
- App SHE#70.5aiv - Screening Analysis A9b_ILIM 2018 En
- App SHE#70.5bi - Response on Exclusion Priorities and SuppActPreferences Arkhangelsk En
- App SHE#70.5bii - Response on Exclusion Priorities and SuppActPreferences Karelia En
- App SHE#70.5biii - Response on Exclusion Priorities and SuppActPreferences Komi En
- App SHE#70.5biv - Response on Exclusion Priorities and SuppActPreferences Murmansk En
- App SHE#70.5bv - Response on Exclusion Priorities and SuppActPreferences Nenets En
- App SHE#70.6ai – Draft ToR for SHE Support Activity No6 (Refined S&A and Criteria for N3)
- App SHE#70.6aii – Draft ToR SuppApp No2 On Oil Contamination and Remediation
- App SHE#70.7a – Thinking Paper on HSEP Sub-Steps.doc
- App SHE#70.7b- HS Progress Sheet September2018 En.xls
- App SHE#70.8a – SHE Mandate Draft v0.2 (FI+NEFCO).doc
- App SHE#70.8b - BEAC CSO Communication Strategy.pdf