

Minutes

78th Meeting of the BEAC WGE Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion, (SHE#78)

Stora Sjöfallet, 27th of March, 2019

1. Opening of the Meeting

The meeting was opened and attended by the following participants:

- Ms. Helena Dahlbo, FI
- Ms. Anne-Marie Mo Ravik, NO
- Ms. Ingrid Lillehagen, NO
- Mr. Åke Mikaelsson, Chair, SE
- Mr. Rickard Nätjehall, SE
- Ms. Elin Kronqvist, SE
- Mr. Alexander Druchinin, Co-Chair, RU
- Mr. Alexander Alexander Yerulik*, RU
- Ms. Julia Bobina, IBS
- Mr. Henrik Forsström, NEFCO
- Mr. Boris Kochetkov, translator

* The meeting was honoured by the sincere attendance by Mr. Alexander Yerulik, Minister of Nature Resources, Environment and Forestry of the Arkhangelsk Oblast.

2. Adoption of the Agenda

The agenda was adopted with without changes.

3. Follow-up of tasks distributed at the previous meeting

The delegate assigned responsible gave a brief up-date of the findings as well as the extent of completion of their respective task:

Task	Responsible	Status
i. Chair the communication meeting in Helsinki on the 13/3, produce minutes and prepare Julia to hold a presentation at the SHE meeting in Stora Sjöfallet	Jessica	Done!
ii. Propose agenda points for additional support activities e.g. at Boliden etc. <i>To be discussed under point 6d and executed till SHE #79.</i>	Henrik	Not done
iii. Prepare the agenda for SHE meeting at Stora Sjöfallet	Åke	Done!
iv. Discuss the draft a letter to the HEGs on Communication Issues and find out how they prefer to work with communication issues on environment <i>To be discussed under point 8 and executed till SHE #79.</i>	Julia & Alexander	Not done
v. Establish contacts with regional HEG Communication officers as well as communication routines, tailor-made for respective region <i>Attempted without success. The task has been tabled for now.</i>	Julia	Initiated, not completed

vi. Submit e-mails to the respective Task Force with detailed instructions and information regarding the tasks marked with **) in SHE#76.4 Minutes	Åke	Done!
vii. Provide a gathered summary table on S&As etc. and the hot spots for which TEC experts and any kind of response is required	Åke	Not done
viii. Report from the meeting of the TF on Communication, incl. progress on elaboration of a Draft ToR for SuppAct No10. <i>Julia and Jessica will deliver till SHE #79</i>	Jessica and Julia	Not done
ix. Discuss a possible scope for an SA No1b seminar in Arkhangelsk, incl. Heat and Power Plants, Contaminated Soils and perhaps Solid Waste	Ruslan, Ivan, Tatiana, Alexander, Åke	Done!
x. Discuss a possible scope for an SA No1b seminar in Murmansk incl. Mining and Hazardous Waste recycling á la Rönnskär <i>A phone meeting with Åke, Alexander and Igor will be attempted on April 2-3 or the 15th.</i>	Ruslan, Igor, Tatiana, Alexander, Åke	Not done
xi. Comment on the Draft ToR for an SA No2 on "Oil contamination and remediation", proposed by Arkhangelsk HEG	TEC on ContamSoils	Done!
xii. Appoint TEC experts for review and comments on Ko1 and Ko8 together with possible Nordic expert(s)	Henrik	Not done

4. Review of Minutes from previous meetings

The Minutes from SHE#75, SHE#76 and SHE#77 were adopted with the small alternation to Alexander's stated position: He works at the International organization division under the department of international cooperation and is not the deputy head of the division as stated in the Minutes.

5. Up-date on Correspondence with the Regional Hotspot Exclusion Groups (Regional HEGs)

a) Up-date on recent correspondence with the regional HEGs

It was concluded that Support Activities No1b have been held in Petrozavodsk and Naryan-Mar. No new update on the correspondence.

b) Review on the remaining hotspots incl. 1) current documentation (Screening & Analysis Reports, TEC-comments, Action Plans etc.), 2) expressed priorities from the regional HEGs, 3) discussion on candidates for "Orange labelling" and exclusion scenarios:

i) Arkhangelsk HEG

The situation with the remaining hotspots in Arkhangelsk Oblast was discussed.

A3: Minister Yerulik expressed an interest for relevant Support Activities on hotspot A3-1.

Of particular relevance are Support Activity No6 (Assistance in up-dating S&A report and formulation of Specific Exclusion Criteria) and Support Activity No7 (Assistance in Drafting of Action Plan/Environmental Performance Enhancement Plan).

➔ Request TF on Heating Facilities to elaborate draft ToR on an SuppAct No6(+7) for A3-1 (Åke)

A5: The S&A Report states a significant reduction in emissions and that the hotspot is aligned with Russian regulation and also compatible with most European BREFs. It was again concluded that SHE recommends A5 for exclusion.

A7: It was repeatedly concluded that the suggestion from Arkhangelsk HEG to split hotspot A7 into one military and one civil part requires that the Arkhangelsk HEG submits two separate and updated reports (i.e. one S&A report for A7.1 and one S&A report on A7.2). Also here it was suggested that Arkhangelsk HEG considers requesting a Support Activity No6 (possibly in combination with No7).

➔ *Request Arkhangelsk HEG to submit two updated and separate S&A reports on A7.1 and A7.2. (Alexander)*

A9: It was recapitulated that A9 had been proposed and decided for split into A9.1 (Pulp and Paper) and A9.2 (Timber industries). Under this division, two Screening & Analysis Reports addressing hotspot A9.1. had been submitted and reviewed, however each of them describing the dioxin emissions/discharges from their respective plant: S&A report A9.1a for Novodvinsk PPM and S&A Report on A9.1b (Illim Pulp, Koryazhma, Kotlas). However A9.1. being well documented, it was concluded that there is no up-dated Screening & Analysis Report for the Timber Industry part and thus concluded that an up-dated S&A report for A9.2 is required. During discussion it was concluded that SHE assumes A9.1 to be ready for fast-track exclusion and should be subject for a 2nd review of the S&A Report by TEC experts.

➔ *Ask TEC for a 2nd review of the S&A Report on A9.1a and A9.1b (Åke)*

➔ *Request Arkhangelsk HEG to submit an updated S&A Report for A9.2 (Dioxins from Timber Industries) (Alexander)*

➔ *Initiate a HEG meeting back-to-back with the Support Activity No1b seminar in Archangelsk in late April 2019 (Alexander)*

ii) Karelian HEG

It was concluded that for the remaining Karelian hotspots in general, all Screening & Analysis reports are all from 2011-2013 - and thus need to be updated. Inter alia for this purpose, a HEG meeting should be organized. In addition the Karelian hotspots were reviewed with the following comments:

K2: Concentrate on Support Activity Support Activity No6 (Assistance in up-dating S&A report and formulation of Specific Exclusion Criteria) and preferably also Support Activity No7 (Assistance in Drafting of Action Plan/Environmental Performance Enhancement Plan).

K3: Request clarification from Karelian HEG on what projects are on-going to mitigate the issue with polluted drinking water in settlements

K5: It was concluded that more in-dept information on recent progress is needed. The Chair informed that discussions have been initiated with the hotspot owner to conduct a Support Activity 4+5 (Permit Granting and Environmental Performance Enhancement Plan) on the hotspot.

K6, K7, K8, K9: For all these hotspots updated Screening & Analysis reports are needed. Also here SHE recommends Karelian HEG to consider requesting Support Activities No6 and possibly No7 for reaching progress with the hotspots.

➔ *Initiate a telephone meeting between the Karelia HEG and SHE and request HEG to update Screening & Analysis reports on K2, K3, K5, K6, K7, K8 and K9. (Alexander)*

iii) Komi HEG

The situation with the remaining hotspots in the Komi Republic was briefly discussed.

Ko3: It was concluded that Mondi PPM in Syktyvkar (Ko3-1) has been found a good candidate for a Support Activity 4+5 (Environmental Performance Enhancement Plan + Pilot Permit Granting Exercise). Initial discussions revealed that there may be interest from the enterprise.

Ko4 - Wastewater in Settlements and Ko5 - Drinking Water in Settlements: It was concluded that relevant persons connected to these hotspots should be invited to the Support Activities 2+3: Branch-specific seminar in Petrozavodsk as well as to the Wastewater related Study Tour.

Ko6 - Waste Generation (Ind+municip): It was concluded that also here an updated Screening & Analysis report is needed. Furthermore, a Task Force on Waste should be established. In connection to this, Ms Lillehagen reported that Norway received an application from Norsk Energi A/S about holding different seminars on cleaner production etc. for persons involved with the hotspot. Ingrid promised to share parts of the proposal and it was agreed that it was important that the project, if approved, is in good harmony with the structure and schedule of Support Activities.

Ko8 - Coal Mining Wastes: No news received.

- ➔ *Contact HEG representative with request to arrange a HEG meeting together with members from the SHE-group (Alexander)*
- ➔ *Request Komi HEG to submit updated S&A reports on Ko4, Ko5 and Ko6 (Alexander)*
- ➔ *Establish the (only remaining) SHE TF on Waste management (SHE)*
- ➔ *Review Norsk Energy's project proposal on capacity building for Ko6 and give guidance for harmonisation with Support Activities (SHE)*

iv) Murmansk HEG

M1 and M2: It was decided that SHE rejects the suggested division of M1 and M2 respectively into sub-hotspots for air and water. The nature of the production does not make it suitable to split the two. The SHE-group will formulate this message before sending it to the Murmansk representative

M3+M5: It was concluded that SHE should propose Murmansk HEG to consider combined Support Activity No4+5 or No6+7 for the hotspots M3 and M5.

M4: The SIGRA Group have sent a proposal to the Norwegian Ministry of Environment and NEFCO concerning M4 so they will look at it together. Åke argued that the action should follow the implementation logics of the agreed SHE Support Activities.

- ➔ *Propose Murmansk HEG to arrange a HEG meeting*
- ➔ *Propose Murmansk HEG and consider a Support Activity No4+5 or No6+7 for M3. (Alexander)*
- ➔ *Review the project proposal from SIGRA Group on hotspot M4 and assess/give guidance for the proposal to be in line with the SHE Support Activities*

v) Nenetskiy HEG

It was concluded that N3 within the soon will be examined by Mr Maatti Ilkkanen, NEFCO. SHE recommends HEG to request a Support Activity No6+7 on hotspot N3.

- c) Review of possibilities and Decisions for arranging HEG meetings
It was concluded that a HEG meeting may be possible in Arkhangelsk during 22nd-26th of April 2019, i.e. in parallel with the planned No1b Seminar.

6. Follow-up and Decisions on further steps with the Support Activities

- a) Review of Conducted and Soon Implemented Support Activities
- i) It was agreed that the report from the Support Activity No1b in Naryan-Mar was approved by SHE
 - ii) It was informed that the draft programme for the planned Support Activity No1b in Arkhangelsk 22-26th of April 2019 is expected in about a week. Norway informed that Anne-Marie and Olaug might join.
➔ Write an invitation letter for Ms. Venchikova till the No1b seminar in Archangelsk (Åke)
➔ Ask Timo Jouttijärvi if he can participate on the No1b seminar in Arkhangelsk (Helena)
- b) Review and up-date of experts in the thematic Task Forces and Technical Expert Committees
It was concluded that the experts listed in the Appendix SHE78.6b was correct. For the TF on Communication Ms Aino Lipsanen from Finland was added.
- c) Review and Approval of the ToRs for Support Activities received:
- i-iv) It was concluded that the ToRs for Support Activities i) No2+3 for Pulp and Paper Sector, ii) No2+3 for Wastewater Treatment Sector and iii) No2+3 for Contaminated Soils as well as the iv) No4+5 addressed for Ko3-2 - Mondy Syktyvkar & K5 - Petrozavodsk WWTP were not timely submitted to SHE and thus will be reviewed for approval at SHE#79.
 - v) In order to get started with the ToR for Support Activities No6, primarily addressing for N3 – Wastewater Treatment in Naryan-Mar, it was agreed that Åke and Rickard will draft a “proto-ToR” for Support Activity No6 that will be attached to the Minutes.
 - vi) It was concluded that the ToR for Support Activity No10 on Communication Workshop was not timely submitted to SHE and has to be discussed at a later occasion.
- d) Discussions and Decisions on Support Activities to develop further into complete ToRs:
It was agreed that SHE requests the relevant Task Forces to draft ToRs for Support Activities No6 addressed for the following hotspots:
- i) A3-1 – Severodvinskiy HPP
 - ii) M3 – OAO Apatity
 - iii) M5 – Kovdorskiy GOK
 - iv) Regarding the drafting of a ToR for Support Activity No9 on Energy Savings and Reduced Climate Impact on a Set of Barents Hotspots, it was agreed that Henrik elaborates on this till the next meeting.

7. Report from the TF on Strategic SHE Communication, and discussion on possible communication activities for promoting action projects within the HSE Procedure

- a) Julia reported from the first gathering of the TF on Communication held in Helsinki on the 13th of March 2019. In the workshop on Barents communication participants from NEFCO, IBS and Swedish EPA took part and the tasks, expected results and focus points for communication

- were explored. Next meeting is planned in April. NEFCO, having several communication officers participating on this work, urged SHE members to engage national officers as well;
- b) The need for communication on hotspots, relevant messages and canals of communication was thoroughly discussed, concluding:
- i) The entering into the “orange” field for hotspots qualifying for step 3-5 in the hotspots exclusion process as well as the transition from one step into another should be recognised as events of significance and deserve attention.
 - ii) Issues as Target group and Message have to be defined but also what people could be involved in the region/locally.
 - iii) A unified communication approach for the regions would be beneficial.
 - iv) The aim of the TF on Communication is to facilitate improved communication on conducted work and achievements done by the hotspot owners, the HEGs and SHE
 - v) It is highly important that the communication on hotspot-progress goes through the SHE-group’s official channels and that the Russian regions can refer to BEAC WGE for gaining higher credibility.
- c) For enhancing the communication work, SHE agreed to:
- i) Appoint Ms Aino Lipsanen from the Finnish Ministry of the Environment to the Task Force on Communication
 - ii) Welcome the proposal from Minister Yerulik to Establish a uniform way of communicating progress at specific periods that can then be disseminated to the Russian Ministry of Natural Resources and the Environment and the SHE group
 - iii) Assign the TF to upgrade the Terms of Reference should with the input received from SHE#78 and submit to SHE#79 as a 2nd draft (incl. how to integrate ii above).

8. Follow-up of the Progress Sheet

Due to limited time, the Progress Sheet for the Barents hotspots was only briefly reviewed. Further update will follow given that further progress (e.g. through the launching of addressed Support Activities) are taken notice of.

9. Follow-up of the SHE Work Programme for the Swedish Chairmanship 2018-2019

Due to limited time, the SHE Work Programme for the Swedish Chairmanship was postponed till the WGE#51 on the 28th of March 2019.

10. Preparatory Discussion for SHE’s Reporting to WGE

- a) It was decided that SHE recommends WGE to recommend A5 for exclusion
- b) Due to limited time, the achievements in relation to SHE Work Programme 2018-2019 were only briefly reviewed and a deeper reviewed foreseen at the WGE#51.
- c) As a preparation for the WGE#51 meeting the following day, SHE briefly discussed the Future Perspectives for the Hot Spots Work. General view was that the “positive” scenario described in the Discussion Paper disseminated prevailed, however that in particular the resultative parts of the other scenario also need to be strived for.

11. Any Other Business

No other business were announced.

12. Summary of Next Steps and Distribution of Tasks

Task	Responsible	Deadline
i. Request TF on Heating Facilities to draft a ToR on a SuppAct No6(+7) for A3-1	Åke	SHE#79
ii. Request Arkhangelsk HEG to submit two updated and separate S&A reports on A7.1 and A7.2 and an updated S&A report on A9.2	Alexander	SHE#79
iii. Ask TEC for a 2nd review of the S&A Report on A9.1a and A9.1b, inter alia with respect to possible Fast track exclusion	Åke	SHE#79
iv. Initiate a HEG meeting back-to-back with the SuppAct No1b seminar in Archangelsk in late April 2019	Alexander	SHE#79
v. Initiate a telephone meeting between the Karelian HEG and SHE and request HEG to update Screening & Analysis reports on K2, K3, K5, K6, K7, K8 and K9.	Alexander	SHE#79
vi. Request Komi HEG arrange a HEG meeting and submit updated S&A reports on Ko4, Ko5, Ko6	Alexander	SHE#79
vii. Establish the (only remaining) SHE TF on Waste management	SHE	SHE#79
viii. Review Norsk Energy's project proposal on capacity building for Ko6 and give guidance for harmonisation with Support Activities	SHE	SHE#79
ix. Propose Murmansk HEG to arrange a HEG meeting and consider a Support Activity No4+5 or No6+7 for M3	Alexander	SHE#79
x. Review the project proposal from SIGRA Group on hotspot M4 and assess/give guidance for the proposal to be in line with the SHE Support Activities	SHE	SHE#79
xi. Write an invitation letter for Ms. Venchikova till the No1b seminar in Archangelsk	Åke	SHE#79
xii. Ask Timo Jouttijärvi if he can participate on the No1b seminar in Arkhangelsk	Helena	SHE#79
xiii. Produce a "proto-ToR" for Support Activity No6	Åke/Rickard	SHE#79
xiv. Specify the ToR for Support Activity No9 on energy savings and reduced climate impact on a set of Barents hotspots	Henrik	SHE#80
xv. Upgrade the ToR for SuppAct No10 on Communication to a 2 nd draft, integrating comments received at SHE#78, and submit to SHE	Alexander/Julia	SHE#80
xvi. Propose agenda points for additional support activities e.g. at Boliden etc.	Henrik+TF	SHE#80
xvii. Discuss the draft a letter to HEGs on Communication and find out how they prefer to work with environmental communication	Julia & Alexander	SHE#80
xviii. Establish contacts with regional HEG Communication officers as well as communication routines, tailor-made for respective region	Julia	SHE#80
xix. Provide a gathered summary table on S&As etc. and the hot spots for which TEC experts and any kind of response is required	Åke	SHE#80
xx. Report from the meeting of the TF on Communication, incl. progress on elaboration of a Draft ToR for SuppAct No10.	Jessica and Julia	SHE#80

xxi. Discuss a possible scope for an SA No1b seminar in Murmansk incl. Mining and Hazardous Waste recycling á la Rönnskär	Ruslan, Igor, Tatiana, Alexander, Åke	SHE#80
xxii. Appoint TEC experts for review and comments on Ko1 and Ko8 together with possible Nordic expert(s)	Henrik	SHE#80
xxiii. Propose Komi HEG to request for a Support Activity No6+7 on hotspot N3	SHE/NEFCO	SHE#80

13. Determination of Date for the Next SHE Meeting

It was concluded that **SHE#79 will be held on the 17th of April 2019 at 09.00 – 11.00 CET/10.00-12.00 Suomen aikka and MT on Telephone.**

14. Closure of the Meeting

The Chair expressed his gratitude to SHE for a productive session and closed the meeting at 18.30.