

Minutes

92nd Meeting of the BEAC WGE Subgroup for Hot Spots Exclusion, (SHE#92) St Petersburg, 29th of January, 2020

1. Opening of the Meeting, presentation of delegates

The meeting was opened and attended by the following participants:

- Ms Helena Dahlbo, FI
- Mr Jyrki Laitinen, FI
- Mr Kari Pirkanniemi, FI
- Ms Kristin Eine, NO
- Mr Åke Mikaelsson, Chair, SE (Skype)
- Mr Rickard Nätjehall, SE
- Ms Kristina Svinhufvud, SE
- Mr Anders Törngren, SE (Skype)
- Ms Jessica Henecke-Dahl, SE (from p7, Skype)
- Mr Mikael Lundholm, SE
- Mr Ulf Bjällås, SE
- Ms Tatiana Guseva, Russian BAT Bureau
- Mr Kirill Shchelchkov, Russian BAT Bureau
- Ms Maria Dianova, IBS
- Mr Ruslan Butovskiy, NEFCO
- Mr Henrik G. Forsström, NEFCO (from p6)

2. Adoption of the Agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes, except of minor rearrangements in sequences, aiming to keep the time schedule.

3. Follow-up of tasks distributed at the previous meetings

The delegate assigned as responsible for the respective task, gives a brief up-date of the findings as well as the extent of completion of the task:

Task	Responsible	Status
i. Update the TEC—Review for K5 with comments regarding the (D7b) Karelian HEG-Protocol on Implementation of the EPEP	Kristina	Done!
ii. Up-date the SHE Statement for K5 with comments regarding the (D7b) Karelian HEG-protocol and the approval of the Russian BAT Commission	Rickard & Kristina	Done!
iii. Update the TEC—Review for Ko3-2 with comments regarding the (D7b) Komi HEG-Protocol on Implementation of the EPEP	Anders	Done!
iv. Up-date the SHE Statement for Ko3-2 with comments regarding the (D7b) Komi HEG-protocol and the approval of the Russian BAT Commission	Rickard & Anders	Done!
v. Submit the complete exclusion package on K5 and Ko3-2 to WGE Chair	Åke	Done!
vi. Send out questions to the hotspot owners of K5, Ko3-2 as well as A5 and A9-1 regarding their preferences for communication of the exclusion	TF on Communication	Ongoing
vii. Upon approval of the EPEP for K5: Submit the edited and translated version of D5c for K5 to Karelian HEG and Petrozavodsk WWTP	Alexander	Done!
viii. Upon approval of the EPEP for K5: Submit the edited and translated version of D5c for Ko3-2 to Komi HEG and Mondi Syktyvkar	Alexander	Done!
ix. Submit the final versions submitted by Minpriroda RF of as well the letters to HEGs on up-dates of Screening and Analysis and Criteria Definitions as well as the	Alexander	Done!

letters to Karelian HEG on K5 and Komi HEG on Ko3-2 to SHE for inclusion in the document package to SHE#92		
x. Reach out to communication officers at A5, A9-1, K5, Ko3-2 and discuss their preferences for the communication (incl. regarding Screening & Analysis, Action Plan and Implementation Report) in connection with the hotspots exclusion.	Jessica	Ongoing
xi. Draft a TEC-Review on K7 based on the Screening Analysis Report	TF on Heat and Power Plants	Done!
xii. Draft a TEC-Review on K9 based on the Screening Analysis Report	TF on Waste	Done!
xiii. Propose time and forms for a Specific Exclusion Criteria Definition Meeting for K9	TF on Waste	Ongoing
xiv. Comment on the SIGRA application on M4	TF on Heat and Power Plants	Done!
xv. Prepare a good presentation on the SHE work till the Ministerial meeting	Åke	Done!
xvi. Write down some general principles on which participants and organizations BHSF can fund in the different SHE Support Activities	Henrik	Not done
xvii. Provide input on how statements from SHE should be reflected in the minutes of coming SHE meetings on BHSF funding requested by SHE for engaging TF members nominated by NEFCO, development of ToR and to implement selected Support Activities, or any other funding support that SHE may require from NEFCO.	Henrik	Not done
xviii. Produce a draft 'narrative' for a general video about the history of the Barents exclusion process and the work done	Åke/Rickard	Rescheduled to Spring 2020
xix. Prepare and invite all Task Forces to an exercise for drafting (or support the drafting process for) Support Activity No6 and No7 on relevant hotspots such as A3-1, A7-1, A9-2, M3, M4, M5, M6, M7, M10, N2, N3 etc.	Åke + Henrik	Rescheduled to Spring 2020
xx. Guided by the Proto-ToR on SuppAct No6, draft ToRs for Support Activity No6+7 for N2 and N3	Matti Iikkanen	Rescheduled to Spring 2020
xxi. Continue up-loading all relevant SHE-documents to the SharePoint Platform, starting from SHE #85 and going backwards	Åke	Rescheduled to Spring 2020
xxii. Provide presentation on Barents hotspot work to NEFCO board	Åke/Henrik	Scheduled to Spring 2020

4. Review of Minutes from previous meetings

The minutes from SHE#91 (Telephone) 22nd of January 2020 were approved by FI,NO,SE.

5. Up-date on Exclusion Administration

- a) A brief overview of the correspondence with the regional HEGs on upgrading of exclusion documentation etc, gave at hand that for:
- i. Arkhangelsk: No news were received (except that they will attend at MiMxiv in Luleå)
 - ii. Karelia: The Chairmanship explained that after the SHE#91 meeting on 14th of January 2020, comparisons were made with the SHE Statement of Ko7 from 2017, where also the Specific Criteria were presented as well as the hotspots compliance with them after implemented actions. The Chairmanship therefore deemed it appropriate to upgrade the SHE Statements for K5 and Ko3-2 with two new sections: one for the Specific Criteria and one for the hotspots' Compliance with the criteria after implemented Action Plan (EPEP). Based on this explanation, it was agreed that SHE approves the up-graded SHE Statement on K5.

- iii. Komi: The Chair explained a corresponding situation with the SHE-Statement on Ko3-2 and upon request, got SHE's approval on the up-graded SHE Statement on Ko3-2.
 - iv. Murmansk: The Chair reported that Murmansk HEG had responded on the letter from SHE from December 2019, re-iterating their view on the need for revised approach on the hotspot work. After telephone talk with the HEG Chair it was reconfirmed that Murmansk will attend at MiMxiv in Luleå but that they not yet could propose a date for a combined seminar and HEG meeting in Murmansk for discussion the further work, as suggested by SHE in the Letter to Murmansk HEG.
 - v. Nenets: No news were received from NAO.
- b) Review of the remaining hotspots
- i. The document *AppSHE#92.8b - Overview of Exclusion Documentation* was reviewed and it was taken note of the documentary status of the respective hotspots regarding inter alia Screening & Analysis Reports, TEC-reviews, Criteria, Action Plans etc.
 - ii. No new decisions on up-grading of colour codes indicating hotspot progress (Orange, Yellow and Green labelling) were taken.

6. Follow-up and Decisions on further steps with the Support Activities

- a) Follow-up of Conducted and Soon Implemented Support Activities
- i) Tatiana reported on the details regarding the implementation of the Support Activity No4 – preparation of Action Plan (in the format of an Environmental Performance Enhancement Plan, EPEP) for Mondi Syktyvkar (Ko3-2) and Petrozavodsk WWTP (K5) and that these EPEPs recently also had passed successfully through the review of the Russian Expert Commission as well as the Inter Departmental Commission of assigned Federal Agencies. Furthermore the implementation of the combined Support Activity No5 for the same plants - Summary Seminar on the preparation work – had been successfully implemented at the facilities of Vodokanal of St Petersburg on the 28th of January 2020 with some 100 participants from authorities, enterprises and academia from all of the five Barents Subjects plus St Petersburg present and actively contributing to the discussion. A written report on these Support Activities will soon follow.
- SHE also took note of that the Implementation Reports of the two Action Plans (for K5 and Ko3-2, respectively) had been received and translated just prior to the meeting.
- ii) Henrik reported (just after the Meeting) that the contracting of the consultants for the assignments on the No6 activities addressed for the Murmansk hotspots M3, M4, M5, M6, M7 and M10, has yet not been finally settled, and that it thus cannot be prognised, when the reports on these six hotspots can be expected.
- b) The list of experts in the thematic Task Forces and Technical Expert Committees was reviewed and up-dated. At the same time, SHE agreed for its further work to replace the term Technical Expert Committee with the Task Forces and inclusion of both Nordic and Russian, neutral branch experts.
- c) Assessment of the Support Activities and the SHE Task Forces during the Swedish Chairmanship
The overall work on the SHE Support Activities as well as the organisation of the SHE Task Forces was discussed and assessed jointly, inter alia following the aspects suggested in the agenda.
- i) As effects of the implementation of the Support Activities conducted, were identified:
 - Raised knowledge about BAT and the FZ-219 implementation in the regions

- Enhanced understanding for the connection between FZ-219 and the hotspots exclusion procedure,
- Enhanced understanding for the Full-Track-Exclusion in the regions

ii) As Summary of Lessons Learned and as Recommendations for the Finnish Chairmanship it was concluded that:

- *the Current Set of ten model activities (No1-No10)* are deemed to be appropriate set of Support Activities for the aimed purpose of the Support Activities to be an instrument for promoting progress of the different hot spots through the Hot Spot Exclusion Procedure.

- *the Preparation Procedure for Support Activities* with Proto-ToRs, agreed with SHE to be refined by consultants in cooperation with the SHE Task Forces, was deemed to be appropriate and give enough structure and homogeneity, as well as enabling the relevant details to be developed for the specific hot spot or branch etc. to be supported.

- *the organisation and use of the SHE Task Forces* was found functioning well and being a very constructive form of cooperation, connecting and making use of authority and/or neutral consultant experts in both Russia and the Nordic countries. For the operatibility it was though concluded that the language issue may be a problem. It was agreed that:

- The TF Chairs have to safeguard that the correspondence is inclusive to both Russian speaking and English speaking experts and as default option use the translation services extensively in all correspondence in the group, unless it is totally clear that all experts have a common language.
- Given the inclusion of commercially and juridically neutral Russian experts, the former division of Technical Expert Committee (TEC) together with Rosprirodnadzor Authorities as assessors in different steps of the Hotspots Exclusion Procedure, SHE agreed to replace TEC with the SHE Task Forces.
- Further views of the TF Chairs and experts are welcome till the next SHE Meeting.

iii) Regarding the Administrative issues around the Support Activities, incl. contracting and assignment, it was concluded that:

- *the difficulties at NEFCO* to effectively contract the assigned consultants for their work in the different Support Activities have been perceived as a severe problem which had caused much unnecessary stress and worries during the preparation and implementation of the SHE Support Activities and that the overbridging of the delays and uncertainties to a large extent had been carried out by singel individuals, who based on their personal commitment and dedication to the task had chosen to bravely fulfill the tasks without timely reimbursement of time and costs, thus putting at risk as well their own personal economy as the reimbursment of sub-contractors.

- As the above described contractual problems now are supposed to be solved, the following recommendations for enhancement of the Support Activities were proposed:
- Give reasonable time to agree on the ToRs before the Support Activity is supposed to take place. Some 2-3 months in advance is a good recommendation.
- Make sure that the SHE Task Forces have good time also to the input in the Support Activities and take for grantet that they shall have a role!
- Set clear deadlines for preparations of PowerPoint presentation and other material, so that there is enough time to arrange good translations
- The default condition is that alll PowerPoints shall be bi-lingual!

d) Discussions and Decisions on further Support Activities

No specific decisions on further assignments were taken, but based on the discussion above and the preparations and findings already done, it was concluded that the further work with Support Activities to be foretaken in near time should focus on:

- Promoting the completion of and harvesting the results from the No6 assignments on M3, M4, M5, M6, M7 and M10 in Murmansk as well as the A3-1 (up-coming), A7-1 and A9-2 assignments in Arkhangelsk and Ko6 in Komi (complementary assignment to Norsk Energi for cathing up with Step 2, Step 3 and Step 4 of the HSE Procedure).
- Fulfill the preparations for the combined No3 Activity (Study Tour) on Pulp and paper industry and Water and Wastewater Treatment during spring 2020.

Furthermore, it was deemed relevant, that the Support Activity work as a tool for promoting achievements, should be used in such a way that it safeguarded basically all the hotspots having passed Step 2 and Step 3 (which means a broad launching of No6) and also to bring many of the hotspots through Step 4 and Step 5 (No7) and followingly via recognition of existing Action Plans or No8 support, bring them in to Step 6.

e) Operational Assessment of the Hot Spots Exclusion Procedure with Possible Suggestions for Refinement

- i. Mikael Lundholm, Chair of the TF on Permit Granting, together with Tatiana Guseva, made a brief review of the documentation flow and preparations used for the full-track administration of hotspots K5 and Ko3-2. It was concluded that most of the work had been functionable and logical, but that minor refinements of the documentary flow are needed.
- ii. The Russian procedure for granting of Integrated Environmental Permits (IEP) was presented and compared with the Hot Spot Exclusion Procedure. Key elements were found to be very similar, basically illustrated in the table below:

Steps 3-6 of the Barents Hot Spots Exclusion Procedure	Indicative steps in the BAT-permit procedure (FZ-219)
Step 3: Agree on Specific Exclusion Criteria	Define Conditions for the Permit [Based on BREFs]
Step 4: Draft an Action Plan	Elaborate a Plan for Enhanced Environmental Performance (EPEP)
Step 5: Agree on the Action Plan	Attract funding
Step 6: Implement the Action Plan	Implementation of the EPEP Plan

- iii. Based on the preliminary analysis and discussion during the meeting, it was concluded that there are unclarities regarding decision making in several steps, overlapping group participation etc. It is therefore recommended to:

- ⇒ Clarify and refine the roles of HEGs, Owners, SHE, Consultants and TF's
- ⇒ Reduce and simplify formal procedural steps, letters, protocols, invitations etc.

- ⇒ Look into the category one facilities on the hot spots list, to see whether they should be treated differently from the other hot spots because they are now under the Russian BAT-regime

Furthermore, it was concluded that in the HSE Procedure, the Action Plan is designed to meet defined Exclusion Criteria, while in the IEP Procedure, the Permit defines requirements/criteria. Therefore, in future plans it is recommended to:

- ⇒ Carry out Support Activity 5 on IEP and Support Activity 6 on Screening & Analysis (Specific Exclusion Criteria) *before* Support Activity 4 EPEP (Action Plan)

It was agreed that a more detailed analysis and recommendation for this will be elaborated before the Summer vacations 2020

7. Report from the TF on Strategic SHE Communication, and discussion on possible communication activities for promoting action projects within the HSE Procedure

- a) Review and Decisions on Operative Communication Activities
 - i. The up-dated hotspot map and hotspot list at the IBS Web-page were reviewed and it was found that the map was satisfactory but that the list still needs to be up-dated, in particular the yellow fields.
 - ii. It was concluded that no contacts had yet been made by the TF on Communication and the regional communicators in order to catalyst any decisions on Communication Actions related to the sub-steps of the Hot spot exclusion procedure (P2f, P5bc, P6c, P7d). The issue was discussed and it was agreed that the TF will give priority to this issue immediately.
- b) Up-date on planned communication work
Jessica reported that:
 - i. the Communication Workshop will take place in St Petersburg on the 18th of February 2020 and that the invitations and primary response has communication experts from all the five Russian Federative Subjects in the Barents region.
 - ii. the preparation of the Hotspot Exclusion Communication Toolbox is ongoing but will develop further only after the conduction of the Communication Workshop.
 - iii. the outreach to regional communication colleagues regarding individual hotspots (incl. the important work on the P2f, P5bc, P6c, P7d of the HSE Procedure) will be intensified after the Communication Workshop.

8. Follow-up of the Progress Documentation and the SHE Work Programme

The Chair presented the recently up-dated versions of the Progress Sheet, the Overview on Exclusion Documentation as well as the Overview on Support Activity Implementation, which hereby are handled over to the Finnish Chairmanship. Based on App SHE#92.8d – Report to the WGE, the Chair then reviewed the Work Done in SHE during the Swedish Chairmanship 2018-2019. As an assessment of the achievements, it was concluded that all the Programme Objectives (P1-P5) were achieved and that the Support Activities had played an important role in these achievements.

Regarding the Operative Objectives, however, it was concluded that only one of them: O1 – “Experts at regional level trained in both FZ-219, Russian and EU BAT and BREFs” had been achieved completely (thanks to the implementation of No1a and No1b in all five subjects as well as No2 for PPM and WWTP branches.

The *Operative Objectives O2, O3a and O3b* were achieved only thanks for K5 and Ko3-2, i.e. thanks to the Support Activities No 2 for PPM and WWTP and No4+5 conducted for these two hotspots. For the broader view, the initiated No6 activities may soon result in Specific Criteria set for many hotspots (A1-1, A1-2, A7-1, A9-2, M3, M4, M5, M6, M7, M10, N3) and via Support Activity No7 be promoted to draft and agreed on Action Plans then reach Step 5 of the Hot Spot Exclusion Procedure for the same hotspots. This, however, will have to take place during the Finnish Chairmanship and it could be regarded so that the Swedish Chairmanship at least managed to make a good preparation for this.

Regarding O4 – “Action Projects obviously leading to reduced environmental impact is under implementation at minimum one HS per Federation Subject (= Step 6)” it has to be concluded that this objective was not achieved at all. No jointly agreed action projects are identified or launched. Hopefully a good objective to try further on when ground now has been paved for? Ko6 and M4 being good candidates if the Criteria and Action Plans agreed.

9. Preparatory Discussion for SHE’s Reporting at the Ministerial Meeting in Luleå

- a) The SHE Chair briefly commented about his planned presentation on the Hotspot work at the MiMxiv in Luleå. The presentation will be made by the Swedish Chair with support from the Russian Co-Chair and include the following three parts:
 - i. Short history of the Barents Environmental Hotspots, SHE, the Criteria and the Procedure as well as connection to FZ-219 and the rationale of joint work on the hotspots,
 - ii. State of Exclusion and Support Activities
 - iii. Achievements in relation to SHE Work Programme 2018-2019
 - iv. Short suggestions to Refinement of the HSE Procedure, based on the findings reported on in SHE#92.6e.

- b) Rickard Nätjehall made a brief presentation of the final version of the SHE Brochure to be disseminated at the MiMxiv in Luleå on 5th of February 2020.

10. Any Other Business

No other businesses were addressed

11. Summary of Next Steps and Distribution of Tasks

In follow of the meeting, the below old and new tasks were distributed, here presented in chronological order:

Task	Responsible	Status
i. Digest the experience with the Task Force work and formulate possible suggestions for enhancements in the organisation and/or content of the work	TF experts TF members	15Feb2020
ii. Send out questions to the hotspot owners of K5, Ko3-2 as well as A5 and A9-1 regarding their preferences for communication of the exclusion	TF on Communication	15Feb2020
iii. Reach out to communication officers at A5, A9-1, K5, Ko3-2 and discuss their preferences for the communication (incl. regarding Screening & Analysis, Action Plan and Implementation Report) in connection with the hotspots exclusion.	TF on Communication	15Feb2020
iv. Write down some general principles on which participants and organizations BHSF can fund in the different SHE Support Activities	Henrik	28Feb2020
v. Provide input on how statements from SHE should be reflected in the minutes of coming SHE meetings on BHSF funding requested by SHE for engaging TF	Henrik	28Feb2020

members nominated by NEFCO, development of ToR and to implement selected Support Activities, or any other funding support that SHE may require from NEFCO.		
vi. Produce a draft 'narrative' for a general video about the history of the Barents exclusion process and the work done	Åke/Rickard	31March2020
vii. Prepare and invite all Task Forces to an exercise for drafting (or support the drafting process for) Support Activity No6 and No7 on relevant hotspots such as A3-1, A7-1, A9-2, M3, M4, M5, M6, M7, M10, N2, N3 etc.	Åke + Henrik	31March2020
viii. Guided by the Proto-ToR on SuppAct No6, draft ToRs for Support Activity No6+7 for N2 and N3	Matti Iikkanen	31March2020
ix. Continue up-loading all relevant SHE-documents to the SharePoint Platform, starting from SHE #85 and going backwards	Åke	31March2020
x. Provide presentation on Barents hotspot work to NEFCO board	Åke/Henrik	31March2020
xi. Guided by the Proto-ToR on SuppAct No6, draft ToRs for Support Activity No6+7 for N2 and N3	Henrik + Yana	31March2020
xii. Guided by the "Proto-ToR", draft a ToR for Support Activity No9 on Energy Savings and Reduced Climate Impact for a set of Barents hotspots and submit to SHE	Henrik	31March2020
xiii. Propose a detailed refinement of the contents, roles and wording etc. of the Sub-steps of the HSE Procedure and its deliverables	TF Permit Granting	30 June 2020

12. Handing over the SHE-Chairmanship from Sweden to Finland

The incoming SHE Chair, Ms Helena Dahlbo made a brief introduction to Finland's priorities for the Chairmanship February 2020- early 2023. A more detailed presentation will be submitted at and after the Ministerial Meeting, but it was already now declared that the Finnish Chairmanship will:

- Give extra priority to waste management issues
- Continue with the Support Activities in basically the same manner and welcomes that Sweden has declared readiness to assist Finland in much of the work with planning and administering the Support Activities and also to keep the current staffing in the Task Forces at basically the same level.

13. Determination of Date for the Next SHE Meetings

The incoming SHE Chair, Ms Helena Dahlbo, submitted that exact date for the next SHE meeting, SHE#93, will be announced at or after the up-coming Ministerial Meeting, but is likely to take place during February or March 2020.

The first WGE during the Finnish Chairmanship though has been determined to take place in Joensuu, North Karelia, on 3-5th of June, 2020.

14. Closure of the Meeting

The Chair expressed his gratitude to the attending SHE members and closed the meeting at 16.35 MT.

Appendices

- App SHE#92.4i – Draft Minutes from SHE#91 En.doc
- App SHE#92.5a11 – SHE Statement on K5 RevFINAL (16Jan2020) En.doc

- App SHE#92.5aii2 - (D6) Implementation Report K5 En
- App SHE#92.5aiii 1– SHE Statement on Ko3-2 RevFINAL (16Jan2020) En.doc
- App SHE#92.5aiii2 - Implementation Report Ko3-2 En.doc
- AppSHE#92.6b – Summary Table on SHE TF experts (24Jan2020).doc
- App SHE#92.7b – Contacts to communication officers Barents 24.01.2020 En.doc
- App SHE#92.8a – Up-dated Progress Sheet (27Jan2020) En.doc
- App SHE#92.8b – Overview on Exclusion Documentation (24Jan2020) En.doc
- App SHE#92.8c – Overview on Support Activity Implementations (24Jan2020) En.doc
- App SHE#92.8d – SHE Report to WGE 29Jan2020 En.ppt
- AppSHE#92.9a - SHE Presentation at MiMxiv in Luleå 5Feb2020 En.ppt
- AppSHE#92.9b – Draft Brochure to the Ministerial Meeting En.doc (Rickard)