

## **MINUTES OF THE BARENTS CLEANER PRODUCTION TASK FORCE MEETING**

**27.1.2005**

**Oulu, Finland**

### **PARTICIPANTS:**

**Finland**, Ministry of the Environment

Mr. Markku Hietamäki (chair), Environment Counsellor

Ms. Kirsi Kentta (secretary), Senior Adviser

Mr. Martti Poutanen, Counsellor

Ms. Henna Haapala, Senior Adviser

Ms. Ann-Britt Ylinen, Counsellor

Mr. Jyrki Terva, MRA/Finland

### **Norway**

Ms. Ingvild Swensen, Ministry of the Environment

### **Sweden**

Ms. Gunilla Blomquist, Ministry of Sustainable Development

### **Russia**

Mr. Yuri Alexandrovsky, Ministry for the Natural Resources of the Russian Federation

Mr. Nikolai Ivanov, Ministry for the Natural Resources of the Russian Federation

Ms. Victoria Sapozhnikova, Federal Service for Ecological, Technological and Atomic Supervision under the Government of Russian Federation (Rostekhnadzor)

Ms. Larisa Yanchik, Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre

Mr. Jan Tsygankov, Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre

Mr. Viktor Kuznetsov, Arhangelsk Region

Mr. Alexander Shirlin, Deputy Head, Administration of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection of the Republic of Karelia

Mr. Valery Solomonov, Director, Cleaner Production Centre in the Republic of Karelia

Ms. Tatyana Tyupenko, Chief Specialist, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection of the Republic of Komi

Mr. Agvan Movsesyan, Head of Department, Administration of the Nenets Autonomous Okrug

### **Observer**

Ms. Elisabet Paulig-Tønnes, Senior Manager, NEFCO

Mr. Karl-Johan Lehtinen, Senior Manager NEFCO

Ms. Ella Barnes, US EPA

Mr. Bob Dyer, ACAP Chairman, US EPA

## **Interpreters**

Mr. Aleksei Repin

Mr. Toomas Kaselan

The chair, Mr. Markku Hietamäki, opened the third Task Force Meeting under the Finnish chairmanship of the Barents Cleaner Production Task Force and welcomed the participants.

The Agenda of the Meeting was adopted. Mr. Jan Tsygankov presented the results of the Moscow Cleaner Production Conference (see annex). Ms. Swensen stated that the results of the Moscow conference exceeded her expectations; industries in North-West Russia showed interest and enthusiasm, which was very promising.

Mr. Alexandrovsky highlighted the present situation with the Russian National Action Plan. He stated that each country has its own experiences, but finally also a regional plan should be made. Ms. Larisa Yanchik spoke about the administrative changes in environmental protection in Russia. A new service, Rostekhnadzor, has been created and the national plan must be updated due to these changes.

Ms. Yanchik went through the Russian National Action Plan. The work on databases has been started. A project on large lakes in the catchment area of Baltic Sea is ongoing. The CP training has been expanded to include the small municipal enterprises, first in Karelia and then also in Arkhangelsk Region. A new programme has been developed for the Russian military forces. An anti-dioxin programme will be started at the Kotlas and Arkhangelsk pulp and paper mills. A yearly report on how the promotion of sustainable development has succeeded in Russia should be made by Russian authorities. Ms. Yanchik stated that the efforts of the ACAP, Barents WGE and CP Task Force should be joined to solve the problems with hazardous substances and pesticides.

Ms. Swensen spoke about the latest development on cleaner production and consumption in Norway. An information campaign on the new law on environmental information (part of the Århus process) has been launched. Additionally, work is continuing on procurement rules for the public sector, and on indicators for sustainable development. Ms. Swensen asked if the reporting of Barents ministerial meeting next autumn should be made in a unified format.

Ms. Blomquist stated that similar processes are being developed in Sweden as in Norway. They are trying to get small and medium-size industries interested in setting up their own environmental management systems. A new programme "Business growth based on consideration of the environment" has been started. A life cycle perspective is promoted strongly as is dialogue among different stakeholder groups in the spirit of Integrated Production Policy (IPP). In the framework of Barents co-

operation Sweden plans to continue with education and training in universities and support projects, in connection to the development of legislation. Ms. Blomquist stated that Sweden is waiting for co-ordination of the Task Force before starting further actions. She stressed that there should also be more co-operation with other task forces, like the forest or energy task force.

Mr. Hietamäki said that because of the need for more co-ordination, he proposes that a separate Nordic co-ordination meeting will be held in February in Helsinki. He informed the participants about the actions that the Finnish part of the CP task force has done: two visits to the Komi and Murmansk regions in order to see what is the general picture in environmental protection and how to promote CP in these regions. A project on developing environmental and quality management systems in Karelian industry has been implemented, and three participating companies are now ready for certification under the ISO14001 standard. Some kind of follow-up project may be started next autumn.

A study on the opportunities for introducing EMS in the Murmansk and Arkhangelsk regions has been completed. Similar offers, as in the Karelian project, were made to companies for setting up an EMS, but so far no positive signals from the companies have been received. The capacity-building project of the environmental laboratories in Karelia, Murmansk and Komi will be carried out when the administrative situation will be clearer. Finland will launch a university programme to develop CP components at technological and economic universities and would like to invite Sweden and Norway to join in this effort. The Murmansk waste incinerator project has been completed and the incinerator is now functioning better.

Mr. Hietamäki also reported about the co-operation with the Environmental Committee of the City of St. Petersburg. One seminar on EMS has been organized and three companies will start an EMS-project. An application for a Russian-Swedish-Finnish life –project application on promoting the BAT-principle in industry has been made, called BATIMBACK.

Mr. Alexandrovsky stated that it would be good to get more detailed written information on these ongoing projects. He asked if St. Petersburg could somehow be integrated into the Barents-co-operation as an urban center of North-West Russia. Mr. Alexandrovsky also spoke about the Kyoto protocol and how CP methods could be used in the work of stabilization of the climate.

Mr. Solomonov noted that if Finland works actively in Karelia, it would be good to know what kind of methodology is used when promoting the ISO14001 standard, among other things. Mr. Hietamäki stated that there has to be some competition to ensure the quality of the work.

Ms. Yanchik introduced the idea of joining forces in the work on the hot spots of the Nefco-Amap report, ACAP activities and Barents co-operation. Mr. Dyer welcomed this intervention and Ms. Haapala showed the schedule of the work on hot spots, which could be connected to CP projects, mainly focusing on the pulp and paper industry. WGE sent the message that CP is an important component in this work and that the hot spots guide more and more how action plans should be developed. The ACAP work should also be taken into account. There have been good CP-projects at Pechenga-Nikel. Ms. Haapala stated a future request to the CP task force: to continue identification of CP projects in the work on hot spots. Mr. Dyer said that they are hoping for some guidance from the CP task force in this effort.

Mr. Hietamäki raised the discussion of how to prepare the chairman's report for the WGE at the end of the Finnish chairmanship. Ms. Blomquist stated that the CPTF should agree on what the intention of the policy document was, what has happened with the common and national action plans, what the new products/approaches are – and what should be done in the future. The urgent issue of co-operation with other task forces and the ACAP should be developed further.

Ms. Ylinen clarified the situation with reporting: WGE will report to the ministerial meeting, and the report of the CP task force will also be delivered to the ministerial meeting. Ms. Tyuypenko raised the question of how the Russian regions will report: to the Moscow CP-centre, to Russian Ministry for the Natural Resources or to the Finnish Ministry of the Environment. Mr. Hietamäki stated that that is an internal question for the Russian participants.

After a lively and some what disjointed discussion on the format and content of the final report Mr. Hietamäki summed up that the Chair hopes to get comments on the content of the report in three weeks time. A second version of the report will be prepared after that, and at the next meeting in May in St. Petersburg it will be elaborated further. The last meeting of the CP task force under Finnish chairmanship will be held in September in Helsinki and the Ministerial Meeting will be in Rovaniemi in October 2005.

## **Annex**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE 'CLEANER PRODUCTION AS A CONTRIBUTION TO SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT'**

An International Conference 'Cleaner Production as a Contribution to Sustainable Development' took place on December 6 through 9, 2004, at the Russian Academy for Public Service under the President of the Russian Federation in Moscow.

The Conference was held under the aegis of the Ministry for Natural Resources of the Russian Federation in connection with the 10th anniversary of the Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Program.

163 participants took part in the Conference, including 27 foreign guests from Norway, Finland, Sweden, USA, Bangladesh, UNEP and EC and 9 representatives of the CIS countries.

The participants of the Conference discussed a wide range of questions on its subject-matter (see the Conference Program attached).

The reports and speeches made at the Conference indicate that significant work has been done in the Russian Federation to implement and disseminate Cleaner Production. The Russian Federation at the same level with highly developed European countries in this field, which let us hope for serious increase in the level of utilization of natural resources and for reduction in detrimental environmental impact, with minimum funds spent.

More than 1600 specialists from over 600 companies in Russia, Azerbaijan and Moldova have been trained during the past ten years to master the Cleaner Production methodology. Cost efficiency of the Program is 3 to 6 rubles per each ruble invested in it, which is stipulated by implementing great measures during the training process already to

save raw materials, water, energy and heat supply, to process waste and reduce the amount of pollutants released into the environment.

This process has been greatly influenced by international co-operation, particularly Russian-Norwegian co-operation in this field, and that with Sweden, Finland, USA and other countries and also by the co-operation with the European Union, United Nations Environment Program (UNEP), United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Arctic Council, Barents/EuroArctic Council and other international organizations.

A considerable contribution of the Russian Federation into performing projects aimed at environmental improvement in the Arctic Region and into especially efficient Cleaner Production implementation at the Polar Branch of the JSC Norilsk Nickel Mining & Metallurgical Company was noted in the Arctic Council Declaration, signed by the Ministers of Foreign Affairs in November 2004 in Reykjavik, for the first time in the international practice of the last decade.

A significant role in Cleaner Production dissemination was played by the support from federal executive authorities, Ministry for Natural Resources of the Russian Federation and its regional bodies, as well as by the concern and efforts of numerous regional administrations of the Federation (primarily in the North-West of the Russian Federation) to develop Cleaner Production in their territories.

The experience gained and results obtained at such companies as Solombala, Segezha and Kondopoga pulp & paper mills, State Centre for Nuclear Shipbuilding, JSC Severonickel and Polar Branch of the JSC Norilsk Nickel Mining & Metallurgical Company give reason for claiming that Cleaner Production allows making more efficient use of available resources, saving financial resources and affecting further improvement of companies' activities and their transition to the sustainable production and consumption model.

The Conference, held in the Russian Federation for the first time, was devoted to discussions of capabilities for applying Cleaner Production as a tool to solve foreground economical tasks in our country, pertinent to achieving sustainable production and consumption. For actual implementation of this process, such a tool as Cleaner

Production should be extensively used in combination with other mechanisms of economical management.

The Conference remarked that Cleaner Production implementation in Russia doesn't cover the whole scope of the country's industrial activities at present. In most of the regions, companies involved in different industries and of various forms of ownership do not take proper measures to transfer to Cleaner Production, allow unjustified natural resources consumption and environmental pollution above the specified limits, which badly affects the health of the population. In spite of the fact that Cleaner Production is of an appreciable economic and environmental effect, companies' management and engineering and technical staff do not pay necessary attention to the use thereof. Legal standards and regulations governing environmental protection activities do not reflect the requirements of a step-by-step reorganization of industrial production in full, to secure sustainable production and mitigate ill environmental impact.

The community and nongovernmental organizations are poorly informed about Cleaner Production activities done and, as a result, they take no active part in those.

Specialists graduating from higher schools and finishing specialized secondary technical schools get no qualified Cleaner Production training; no textbooks are published in this field.

In this connection, based on the exchange of views that took place,

### **THE CONFERENCE PROPOSES:**

1. That legislative authorities of the Russian Federation, along with federal executive authorities concerned, make all efforts necessary to accomplish legal regulations adopted, more widely implement Cleaner Production at the companies of different forms of ownership and ensure resources saving and decreasing detrimental effect upon the environment.

To this end, the Ministry for Natural Resources of the Russian Federation, Federal Environmental, Technological and Atomic Supervision Service (Rostekhnadzor) in collaboration with the Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre should develop proposals to

complete the Environmental Protection Law of the Russian Federation with provisions for assistance to Cleaner Production development, to be submitted to the Government of the Russian Federation.

2. To ask the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation, the Government of the Russian Federation and federal executive authorities concerned to liven up the work with regard to revision and adoption of a Bill of Payments for Detrimental Environmental Impact in accordance with established procedure, which would provide for privileges to the companies that have implemented best available technologies (aimed at prevention of excessive adverse effect upon the environment);

For the Bill of Payments for Detrimental Environmental Impact to provide for mandatory recording of assimilation capability and environmental capacity of different territories in charging payments for environmental pollution by means of introducing regional factors to calculate pollution payments;

3. To recommend federal executive authorities concerned to develop drafts of the Federal Law for Environmental Auditing and Subordinate Legislation that would provide for top-priority auditing of the companies located in the areas of high environmental stress.

4. To ask the Government of the Russian Federation to entrust appropriate federal executive authorities with developing a Strategy for transition to cleaner production and sustainable development (for the years 2005 to 2015), to ensure financial measures for its implementation using the funds of federal and regional budgets.

To add to the Strategy mentioned a provision for the need to develop and implement domestic production technologies, equipment and materials that could secure the prevention of excessive adverse environmental pollution.

That the available positive experience be considered as a model for interaction between institutions of state power, industrial enterprises, business and environmental protection organizations (for instance, the Yasnaya Poliana Agreement between the Administration of the Tula



Region, Leo Tolstoy's Memorial Estate in Yasnaya Poliana and OJSC Shchekinazot dated July 27, 2004) in developing and implementing the Cleaner Production Development Strategy in Russia.

5. To recommend federal executive authorities concerned to study the question of creating a Federal Target Program aimed at implementing measures for transition to sustainable development, including transition to Cleaner Production, sustainable consumption and sustainable development of territories within the Russian Federation.

6. To recommend federal executive authorities concerned to elaborate sustainable development indicators (for companies, territories, regions and state on the whole) as well as to develop forms of federal state statistical observation to be able to collect data by such indicators; to stipulate for financing such work using funds from budgets of different levels.

7. That corresponding federal executive authorities create a regulatory and methodical basis for establishing technological rates for emissions and discharge of pollutants into the environment and arrange for economical entities to introduce such rates.

8. To ask regional administrations of the Russian Federation to consider a possibility to provide for the documents, concerning development of territories, to include a provision for priority trends in creating Cleaner Production at the companies located in such territories.

9. In performing companies surveys, recommend territorial environmental protection bodies to identify those which require first and foremost Cleaner Production implementation and submit corresponding proposals to the Ministry for Natural Resources of the Russian Federation and Rostekhnadzor, for them to draw up a list of 'hot spots'.

10. To recommend federal executive authorities concerned, along with research and educational organizations and international experts, to develop a Cleaner Production Training Program, based on

approaches used by the Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre.

11. That appropriate federal executive authorities, jointly with executive authorities in the territories of the Federation, management of the companies located in such territories and public organizations, hold regional meetings/seminars etc., in order to identify prospects and possible time for those companies to carry out transition to sustainable production, including Cleaner Production. Special attention should be paid to the housing and communal sector with respect to implementation of Cleaner Production technologies to ensure resources saving and improvement of domestic waste management system.

12. To ask federal executive authorities to consider a possibility of making appropriate changes to the system of continuous environmental education for all age groups of the community, in order to build up common understanding of the significance of sustainable development issues, including those related to Cleaner Production implementation.

That the federal executive authorities in charge and educational authorities prepare and introduce methods for development and inclusion of Sections for Cleaner Production and further transition to the sustainable production and consumption model into diploma theses by students of higher and secondary technical schools, starting from the year 2006.

13. To ask the Russian Government to assist mass media in reporting to the public at federal, regional and local levels on the principles of and approaches to implementation of Cleaner Production and sustainable consumption as well as on the results of Cleaner Production implementation at Russian companies.

14. That executive authorities of the Russian Federation, in developing international, regional and bilateral co-operation in research and technical and environmental protection spheres, make appropriate international agreements to stipulate for provisions related to implementing Cleaner Production and developing sustainable

production and consumption. Assisting preparation and conclusion of contracts with foreign firms to introduce cleaner manufacturing methods and equipment at Russian companies.

Extending participation of representatives from Russia in international, regional and bilateral activities and initiatives connected with sustainable production and consumption.

15. Based on the significance of the problem the Conference finds it expedient to hold such Conferences every two years, the next one to take place in 2006.

### **Organizing Committee of the Conference**