

**MINUTES OF THE BARENTS CLEANER PRODUCTION  
TASK FORCE MEETING**

**1.-2.12.2003**

**Ministry of the Environment, Helsinki, Finland**

**PARTICIPANTS:**

Finland, Ministry of the Environment  
Mr. Markku Hietamäki (chair), Environment Counsellor  
Ms. Kirsi Kentta (secretary), Senior Adviser  
Mr. Martti Poutanen, Counsellor  
Ms. Henna Haapala, Senior Adviser

Norway, Ministry of the Environment  
Mr. Magne H Roed  
Ms. Brita Slettemark

Sweden, Ministry of the Environment  
Ms. Gunilla Blomquist

Russia  
Mr. Yuri Alexandrovsky, Deputy Director, Ministry of the Natural Resources of  
Russia  
Mr. Alexander Obuhovsky, Vice Head of the Department of the State Control and  
Perspective Development in the field of Nature Management and Environmental  
Protection in North-west Federal District  
Ms. Tatyana Tyupenko, Chief Specialist, Ministry of Natural Resources and  
Environmental Protection of the Republic of Komi  
Ms. Larisa Yanchik, Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre  
Mr. Nikolai Busykanov, Embassy of the Russian Federation

**NEFCO**

Ms. Elisabet Paulig-Tønnes, Senior Manager

Ms. Tarja Tolonen, Interpreter

Mr. Markku Hietamäki, the chair, opened and welcomed the first Task Force Meeting under the Finnish chairmanship of the Barents Cleaner Production Task Force.

The Agenda of the Meeting was adopted. Mr. Hietamäki stated that the Helsinki meeting was the first major event after the Swedish chairmanship of the Barents CP Task Force. The first task is to agree on how to prepare the national action plans and then the working group should examine in which way the CP method could be used in the implementation of the hot spot list of the NEFCO-AMAP report, which was

published at the Sixth Meeting of Environment Ministers of the Barents Euro-Arctic Council in Luleå. The CP policy document, adopted by the ministers in Luleå, underlines good co-operation with the Barents Regional Council and the energy sector. The next Barents environmental working group meeting will be organized back to back with the Barents Regional Council in Kuhmo, on March 17-18. The groups shall give a progress report in Kuhmo. Mr. Hietamäki said that it is up to this meeting to decide in which way the reports will be presented at the Kuhmo meeting.

Mr. Martti Poutanen introduced the results and the declaration of the Environment Ministers meeting in Luleå. He noted that the Second Nordic Dimension Action Plan has been adopted and that the results of the Luleå meeting have been taken into account in the action plan. The Tacis and Cross-border Co-operation programmes will be renewed in the coming year and the Barents Region should have its fair share of the New Neighbourhood programmes of the EU.

Ms. Brita Slettemark asked if a representative of the EU would be invited to the CP Task Force meetings, as discussed earlier. Mr. Hietamäki said that he thinks it is a good idea to invite the EU and he promised to inform EU. One should aim to have valid, well-prepared projects in order to get some financing from the EU.

Ms. Gunilla Blomqvist introduced the CP policy document and action plan. It was proposed to set the priority of the actions and to determine their feasibility and to agree on the responsibilities.

Mr. Hietamäki invited the Russian partners to present views and ideas on CP co-operation before starting the general discussion on the implementation of the action plan.

Mr. Alexandrovsky highlighted the situation concerning the legal basis of environmental protection in Russia; in the year 1997 a strategy on sustainable development and the concept of environmental safety were introduced. A long-term strategy, known as an environmental doctrine, was adopted in 2002. He said that although the term "cleaner production" is not mentioned in this strategy, the elements of cleaner production are there. The doctrine covers all the important elements of the CP concept. An important task is how to develop further the legal basis in order to enhance the CP and best available technology (BAT) approach.

At the moment, the experts at the Ministry of Natural Resources work on regulation, which encourages industry to get certifications. Mr. Alexandrovsky stated that the average person finds only production questions and issues to be important; the concept of sustainable consumption and production is still at a very early stage. He also spoke about the results of the assessment of the state of the environment in 2002. In general terms, the state of the environment is improving in North-west Russia and here one could suppose that the concept of cleaner production has had some influence. He also said that the Deputy Director of UNEP, Mr. Klaus Töpfer, recently signed an agreement on implementing CP projects in line with UNEP-GEF.

Mr. Obuhovsky spoke about energy-saving possibilities in the municipal and housing services of St. Petersburg and about waste utilisation. He proposed the removal of an old industrial facility from the city centre as a possible project or co-operative action,

or, for a larger CP measure, selecting a pulp and paper industry as a pilot project. This approach could also be utilised in the Barents Region, he added.

Ms. Tyupenko mentioned that in Syktyvkar, in the Komi Republic, a new kind of development has started: Komi is the first place in Russia where energy efficiency and CP centres have been integrated. Co-operation with the following branches would be most important: oil and municipal companies and the forestry and wood-producing industries. A key issue is a change in viewpoint and to start planning at the local level—it is very important to see positive changes, and to change the world step by step. She also mentioned a training programme on environmental protection, which would be implemented from kindergarten to university.

Ms. Larisa Yanchik presented the keypoints of the activities of Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre (see annex 1).

Ms. Elisabet Paulig-Tønnes highlighted NEFCO's activities in the field of CP (see annex 2). Referring to the NEFCO/AMAP Hot Spot list, her main message was that they do not see these projects as Cleaner Production Projects in the sense that we use the concept, as hopefully was understood from the presentation. But, as she mentioned, NEFCO will discuss the projects with the local and regional authorities. Financing for the Hot Spot projects will, of course, also be needed from other sources, which is important to remember. Additionally, thorough preparation and commitment from the local side will be needed. So, if one project can be prepared and implemented each year in each region, the projects on the list will be dealt with within approximately 10 years.

After NEFCO's presentation, the countries described their CP activities and national action plans.

Ms. Brita Slettemark spoke about pollution control in Norway and about Norway's widespread CP activities in Russia on four different levels (see annex 3).

Ms. Gunilla Blomquist highlighted Sweden's situation. She stressed that co-ordination with other programmes, like Integrated Product Policy, is important and that there should be more resources for the implementation of the Barents CP action plan. She said that the Swedish Environmental Protection Agency is working on the action plan at the moment. The Swedish Industry Federation is due to take part in the process, too, and co-ordination takes time. She also said that it is important to know what are Russia's plans, because only then can we figure out what is the best way to support them. Co-ordination between all actors is important, as is the development of good case studies.

Mr. Hietamäki highlighted Finland's position in CP co-operation .

In Finland CP and the use of BAT have been common elements of environmental protection for a long time. The use of BAT is a basic element of the environmental protection act.

Finland has some CP projects ongoing in Barents area in Karelia and Murmansk region. Finland has co-operation with some enterprises in Karelia to build up both ISO 9000 (quality system) and ISO 14000 (environmental management systems). In Murmansk we have co-operation in environmental protection with the waste incinerator. This project is co-ordinated with NEFCO. Both in Karelia and Murmansk we have capacity building project with environmental laboratories.

The Finnish action plan shall have these elements. The plan is under preparation.

Ms. Larisa Yanchik commented upon information of Finland's position in CP co-operation and made a proposal while working out the Action Plan including all national action Plans to avoid any overlapping to save money and time. As it was mentioned most of CP activity and CP projects concerned the Russian Part of the Barents Region and it is necessary to join all efforts to execute the Action Plan.

Mr. Alexandrovsky presented Russia's first draft on the national action plan (see attached). He underlined the need for a good database. Mr. Hietamäki said that a well-structured database on CP technologies would be useful in promoting CP, if updated regularly. He also mentioned that much valuable information can be found from EU/BAT Reference Documents (B). For example, there are already about 50 sectoral BREFs. This information should be taken into consideration when assessing the usability of a CP database.

Mr. Alexandrovsky brought up the question of the official position of the Russian-Norwegian Cleaner Production Centre in Moscow as taking into account the RNCPC is the organization which practically implemented and disseminated CP Programme in the Russian Part of the Barents region together with its regional branches in Murmansk, Archangelsk and Petrozavodsk. Mr. Alexandrovsky asked the Chairman for a special request to be made for the WGE to find out an opportunity to give a new status and name for the Centre and find out a possibility for its' financial support. As de facto the RNCPC has a strong position concerning CP activities in Russia but with the financial support on behalf of the Norwegian Government. Mr. Hietamäki replied that the Moscow CP Centre has a de facto position concerning CP activities in Russia; however, it is not clear if the Task Force can appoint official institutions.

Mr. Hietamäki summed up the results of the task force meeting: All participants will send a draft of a national action plan before the end of January. After these have been prepared it will be possible to see where are the areas of fruitful co-operation and where are the gaps, i.e. what is missing.

Ms. Larisa Yanchik spoke about the preparations for the Russian Round Table on CP, which will be held in Moscow in December 2004.